Y Pwyllgor Cymunedau, Cydraddoldeb a Llywodraeth Leol
The Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee

Dydd Iau, 23 Hydref 2014
Thursday, 23 October 2014

Cynnwys
Contents

Cyflwyniadau, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions

Craffu ar Gyllideb Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru 2015-16—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth gan y Prif Weinidog
Scrutiny of Welsh Government 2015-16 Draft Budget—Evidence Session from the First Minister

Comisiynydd y Gymraeg: Trafod yr Adroddiad Blynyddol
Welsh Language Commissioner: Consideration of Annual Report

Papurau i'w Nodi
Papers to Note

Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o'r Cyfarfod ac o'r Cyfarfod ar 5 Tachwedd 2014
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Meeting and from the Meeting on 5 November 2014

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Peter Black	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats

Christine Chapman	Llafur (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) Labour (Committee Chair)
Alun Davies	Llafur Labour
Jocelyn Davies	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Janet Finch-Saunders	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Mike Hedges	Llafur Labour
Mark Isherwood	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Gwyn R. Price	Llafur Labour
Gwenda Thomas	Llafur Labour
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Meri Huws	Comisiynydd y Gymraeg Welsh Language Commissioner
Carwyn Jones	Aelod Cynulliad, Llafur, y Prif Weinidog Assembly Member, Labour, the First Minister
Dyfan Sion	Cyfarwyddwr Polisi ac Ymchwil, Comisiynydd y Gymraeg Director of Policy and Rsearch, Welsh Language Commissioner
Dr Caroline Turner	Dirprwy Gyfarwyddwr, Is-adran y Gymraeg, Llywodraeth Cymru Deputy Director, Welsh Language Division, Welsh Government
Bethan Webb	Pennaeth Uned y Gymraeg, Llywodraeth Cymru Head of Welsh Language Unit, Welsh Government

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Liz Wilkinson	Clerc Clerk
Chloe Davies	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Rhys Iorwerth	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 10:01.
The meeting began at 10:01.

Cyflwyniadau, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions

[1] **Christine Chapman:** Bore da, and welcome to the National Assembly's Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee.

Craffu ar Gyllideb Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru 2015-16—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth gan y Prif Weinidog
Scrutiny of Welsh Government 2015-16 Draft Budget—Evidence Session from the First Minister

[2] **Christine Chapman:** This is the final session to scrutinise the Welsh Government's 2015-16 draft budget. So, I welcome Carwyn Jones, the First Minister; Caroline Turner, the deputy director of the Welsh language division; and Bethan Webb, the head of the Welsh language unit. I welcome you, First Minister, and your officials.

[3] **The First Minister (Carwyn Jones):** Thank you, Chair.

[4] **Christine Chapman:** We are going to ask you questions today about the budget. Members will have received a paper from Welsh Government so, if you are happy, we will go straight into questions. I will start off. Could you say something about the evidence base used to reprioritise budgets for the Welsh language in order to deliver the Moving Forward policy objectives, First Minister?

[5] **The First Minister:** It was based largely on what we heard in the *Cynhadledd Fawr*, which was an event we organised in Aberystwyth University. The intention was to try to get beyond the usual people who are very interested in the language and listen to the views of those people on the ground, people who are Welsh speakers who are not necessarily politically involved in terms of promoting the language. It was clear from the evidence I heard there that one of the major issues, for example, was making sure that we saw better transmission in families and also that people use the language. It was becoming easy for people to slowly get out of the habit of using the language, particularly because of the challenges of social media and the fact that social media tends to be very strongly biased towards the English language in terms of use. As a result of what I heard there, I took the decision that we needed to make sure that we strengthen the language on the ground. We have done that with the *mentrau iaith* and, of course, provided ways of ensuring that the language was promoted through digital technology; that has happened as well. So, that was one area that we looked at very carefully in terms of trying to reprioritise where the spending should go.

[6] **Christine Chapman:** Could you say something about the time frame in all of this for the '*Bwrw Mlaen'* process? What were your aims in this?

[7] **The First Minister:** The aim is to make sure that those who have the language continue to use it. That is the first main aim. It is important to increase the number of speakers. We all know what the census showed in 2011. It is encouraging that there are more young people who are able to speak the language, but there are certainly challenges in ensuring that those who learned the language in school, particularly those in areas where Welsh is not a community language, have opportunities to use it once they have left school. That is why we have looked to promote the language in the workplace. People should be able to use it and, of course, people should keep on using the language as a matter of habit. That is where the *Pethau Bychain* campaign has come from—to make sure that people do not feel that, once they have left an environment where Welsh is used, they are no longer able to use it. That helps to underpin the wider agenda when it comes to promoting a language more widely across Wales. However, unless we can get people who are already Welsh speakers to continue to use it, we will see that continued erosion in Welsh-speaking communities, and of course we see the erosion in people who list themselves as Welsh speakers but do not actually use it.

[8] **Christine Chapman:** Thank you. Rhodri Glyn, you have a question.

[9] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I fynd â chi yn ôl at y cyfrifiad—rydych wedi cyfeirio at y cyfrifiad—a ydych yn credu bod canlyniadau'r cyfrifiad yn anfon neges glir i ni ynglŷn â sefyllfa'r Gymraeg yng Nghymru heddiw?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: To take you back to the census—you made reference to the census—do you think that the census results send us a clear message as to the situation of the Welsh language in Wales today?

[10] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n anodd, achos nid yw'n glir beth yw'r neges o'r cyfrifiad. Mae'r iaith wedi cael ei chefnogi'n fawr iawn dros y degawd diwethaf, ac mae hynny'n iawn yn awr. Rydym wedi gweld cynnydd yn nifer y bobl ifanc sy'n gallu siarad Cymraeg, ond rydym yn gweld bod y cyfanswm wedi cwympo. Mae'n rhaid inni gyfaddef bod effaith lle mae pobl ddi-Gymraeg yn symud mewn i ardaloedd Cymraeg; nid oes modd osgoi hynny. Y modd o ddelio â hynny yw sicrhau bod teuluoedd, a phlant yn enwedig, yn cael eu trochi—dyna'r gair sy'n cael ei ddefnyddio; mae'n golygu rhywbeth hollol wahanol yn sir Gâr—yn yr iaith fel eu bod yn gweld bod yn ddwyieithog yn rhywbeth hollol naturiol mewn cymunedau dwyieithog.

The First Minister: It is difficult, because it is not clear what the message from the census is. The language has been very well supported over the past decade, and is still being supported. We see that there has been an increase in the number of young people who can speak Welsh, but we see that the total has dropped. We have to admit that there is an impact when non-Welsh speakers move into Welsh-speaking areas; there is no avoiding that. One way of dealing with that is to ensure that families, and children in particular, are immersed—that is the word that is used, although it means something quite different in Carmarthenshire—in the language so that they view being bilingual as a totally natural thing in bilingual communities.

[11] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'n ddiddorol eich bod yn cydnabod bod y mewnlifiad yn cael effaith ar sefyllfa'r Gymraeg; nid yw eich Gweinidog dros yr amgylchedd yn cytuno gyda chi ar hynny, yn ôl y datganiad a wnaeth yn ddiweddar. O ran y mentrau newydd rydych wedi eu cyhoeddi o ganlyniad i'r Gynhadledd Fawr, onid y gwir amdani yw mai'r hyn a wnaethoch oedd symud arian o un fenter i fenter arall, a bod y mentrau newydd yn ganlyniad i dynnu arian yn ôl o ffynonellau a oedd yn bodoli eisoes?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: It is interesting that you acknowledge that inward migration is having an impact on the situation of the Welsh language; the Minister responsible for the environment does not agree with you on that, according to a statement that he made recently. In terms of the new initiatives that you have announced following the *Cynhadledd Fawr*, is it not the case that what you did was to move funding from one initiative to another, and that the new initiatives are a result of withdrawing funding from initiatives that already existed?

[12] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Na, mae peth arian newydd, ond mae'n wir dweud bod arian wedi cael ei ail-flaenoriaethu. Nid wyf yn gallu dod i'r pwyllgor a dweud bod mwy o arian ar gael—nid yw hynny'n iawn. Rydym yn byw mewn oes gyllidol lle mae llai o arian ar gael beth bynnag. Fodd bynnag, un o'r pethau mae'n rhaid i ni ei ystyried yw y bu cynnydd yn y gyllideb i gefnogi'r Gymraeg dros y degawd diwethaf ac rydym wedi gweld cyfanswm y siaradwyr wedi cwympo, felly nid dim ond mater o arian ydyw—mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn

The First Minister: No, there is some new funding, but it is true to say that funding has been re-prioritised. I cannot come to the committee and say that more funding is available—that is not correct. We live in financial times where less funding is available in any case. However, one of the things that we must consider is that there has been an increase in the budget to support the Welsh language over the past decade, but we have seen the total number of speakers decreasing, so it is not only a matter of money—we have to ensure that we also do

gwneud pethau sydd yn fwy effeithiol hefyd. Mae'n wir dweud bod y gyllideb wedi mynd i lawr mewn sawl maes, ond rydym hefyd wedi ail-flaenoriaethu'r arian er mwyn bod yn fwy effeithiol, achos mae'n amlwg nad yw'r pethau a gafodd eu gwneud 10 mlynedd yn ôl wedi gweithio yn y ffordd roedd pawb am eu gweld yn gweithio. Felly, mae'n bwysig dros ben ein bod yn targedu teuluoedd ac unigolion sy'n gallu siarad Cymraeg ond ddim yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg, a sicrhau bod lle i'r Gymraeg yn y byd digidol.

things that are more effective. It is right to say that the budget has decreased in a number of areas, but we have also reprioritised the funding to be more effective, because it is clear that the things that were done 10 years ago are not working in the way that everyone wanted to see. Therefore, it is very important that we target Welsh-speaking families and individuals who do not use it, and ensure that that there is a place for the Welsh language in the digital sphere.

[13] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Felly, rydym yn cytuno y bu gostyngiad yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y Gymraeg yn gyffredinol.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: So, we agree that there has been a decrease in the budget for the Welsh language in general.

[14] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Wrth gwrs—mae'n amlwg o'r ffigurau bod hynny wedi digwydd; ni allaf osgoi hynny.

The First Minister: Of course—it is clear from the figures that that has happened; I cannot refute that.

[15] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A gaf eich cyfeirio, felly, at un maes penodol? Gwnaethoch benderfyniad i ostwng y gyllideb ar gyfer Cymraeg i oedolion a'i ailgyfeirio. A allwch esbonio i ni ar ba sail y gwnaethpwyd y penderfyniad hwnnw?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: May I therefore refer you to one specific area? You made a decision to reduce the budget for Welsh for adults and to redirect it. Could you explain to us on what basis that decision was made?

[16] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oedd yn benderfyniad rhwydd i'w wneud. Ar hyn o bryd, y broblem fwyaf yw pobl ifanc, a sicrhau bod mwy o'r genhedlaeth nesaf yn gallu siarad Cymraeg ac yn ei defnyddio. O achos hynny, rydym wedi gwarchod cyllidebau fel Twf—rwy'n gweld Twf fel rhywbeth effeithiol iawn i sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu trosglwyddo'r Gymraeg i'w plant—ac wedi gwarchod yr arian sydd wedi cael ei hala ar sicrhau trosglwyddo'r iaith. Mae gennym gyllidebau ar gyfer pethau fel 'Mae dy Gymraeg di'n Grêt', a hefyd i sicrhau bod gan bobl hyder yn eu Cymraeg eu hunain. Mae'r Aelod yn cynrychioli ardal lle bu cwymp sylweddol yn y nifer sy'n dweud eu bod yn siarad Cymraeg, ond cynnydd yn y rhai sy'n dweud eu bod yn deall Cymraeg. Nid wyf yn credu bod pethau wedi newid gymaint â hynny, ond mae pobl wedi colli hyder yn eu Cymraeg. Felly, mae'n bwysig dros ben ein bod yn codi eu hyder yn eu Cymraeg eu hunain. Os na wnawn hynny, ni wnânt drosglwyddo'r Gymraeg, achos byddant yn dweud 'Nid yw fy Nghymraeg yn ddigon da i'w throsglwyddo i'r genhedlaeth

The First Minister: It was not an easy decision to make. At present, the biggest problem is young people, and ensuring that more of the next generation are able to speak Welsh and that they use it. As a result, we have protected budgets such as *Twf*—I see *Twf* as a very effective vehicle to ensure that people are able to transfer the Welsh language to their children—and have protected the spend on ensuring that the language is transferred. We have budgets such as '*Mae dy Gymraeg di'n Grêt*', and also to ensure that people have confidence in their own Welsh language skills. The Member represents an area where there has been a significant decrease in the number of people who say that they can speak Welsh, but an increase in the number who say that they can understand it. I do not think that things have changed that much, but people have lost confidence in their Welsh. Therefore, it is very important that we raise confidence in people's Welsh language skills. If we do not, they will not transfer the Welsh language, because they will say 'My Welsh isn't good enough to transfer to the next

nesaf, felly wna'i ddim'. Wrth ystyried y ffigurau yn y cyfrifiad, y flaenoriaeth ar hyn o bryd yw sicrhau bod y rheini sy'n siarad Cymraeg yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg, a bod hyder ganddynt yn eu Cymraeg, ac, yn ail, sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn cael ei throsglwyddo. Dyna pam ein bod wedi gwarchod cynlluniau fel Twf.

generation, so I won't'. Bearing in mind the figures in the census, the priority at present is to ensure that those who speak the language use it, and that they have confidence in their Welsh, and, secondly, to ensure that the Welsh language is transferred. That is why we have protected schemes such as Twf.

[17] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Rydych yn sôn am gynnydd yn y gefnogaeth i'r Gymraeg, ond y gwir amdani yw ein bod yn sôn yn y fan hon am symiau cymharol fach o arian yng nghyd-destun y gyllideb gyffredinol. Y neges sylfaenol o'r Gynhadledd Fawr, a sefydlwyd gennych chi fel Prif Weinidog Cymru â chyfrifoldeb am y Gymraeg, oedd bod angen mwy o arian ar y Gymraeg er mwyn sicrhau ei ffyniant hi i'r dyfodol. Rydych wedi anwybyddu'r alwad honno.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You mention an increase in support for the Welsh language, but the truth is that we are talking here about relatively small sums of money in the context of the wider budget. The fundamental message from the *Cynhadledd Fawr*, which you, as First Minister of Wales with responsibility for the Welsh language, established, was that more funding was required for the Welsh language in order to ensure its future development. You have ignored that call.

[18] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Pe bai'r arian gennym ni, byddem yn gallu hala mwy o arian, ond nid yw'r arian yno. Felly, mae'n rhaid inni ailflaenoriaethu'r arian sydd gennym ac rydym wedi gwneud hynny. Os edrychwch ar 'Bwrw Mlaen', rydym wedi sicrhau bod £1.2 miliwn o refeniw ar gael dros ddwy flynedd a £1.25 miliwn o gyfalaf yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon er mwyn gwarchod yr iaith. Fodd bynnag, o ran a fyddem am hala mwy o arian ar yr iaith pe bai'r arian ar gael, efallai'r ateb i hwnnw yw, 'byddem', ond byddai'n rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr arian yn cael ei hala mewn ffordd effeithiol. Ond, mae'n anodd dros ben, yn yr oes gyllidol yr ydym ynddi 'nawr, i gael yr arian hwnnw o ryw ffynhonnell.

The First Minister: If we had more funding, we would be able to spend more money, but the money is not there. Therefore, we must reprioritise the funding available to us and we have done that. If you look at 'Moving Forward', we have ensured that £1.2 million of revenue funding is available over two years and £1.25 million capital funding in this current year in order to safeguard the language. However, on whether we would want to spend more money on the language, if money were available, perhaps the answer would be, 'yes', but we would have to ensure that the money was spent in an effective manner. But, it is extremely difficult, given the financial circumstances that we find ourselves in, to get that funding from any source.

[19] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Rydych yn sôn am ffigurau fel £1.2 miliwn, ond mae hwnnw'n ffigur bach iawn o fewn cyllideb o £15 biliwn.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You mention figures such as £1.2 million, but that is a very small sum within a budget of £15 billion.

[20] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n fwy na hynny, wrth gwrs; dim ond un rhan ohono yw'r arian hwnnw. Mae arian yn cael ei hala ar addysg yn y Gymraeg hefyd, wrth gwrs, ac yn cael ei hala ar y comisiynydd, felly dim ond un rhan o'r gyllideb yw'r arian hwnnw sydd yn rhan o 'Bwrw Mlaen'. Mae arian sylweddol yn cael ei hala, yn enwedig ar addysg. A fyddem yn mo'yn cael mwy o

The First Minister: It is more than that of course; that money is just one section of it. We are spending money on the Welsh language in education, of course, and on the commissioner, so that is just one section of the budget, that money that is a part of 'Moving Forward'. Substantial funding is being spent, particularly on education. Would we wish to secure more funding in the future?

arian yn y dyfodol? Yr ateb yw, ‘byddem’, ond byddai pob Gweinidog yn dweud hynny am bob rhan o’u portffolios nhw. Felly, ar hyn o bryd, mae’n rhaid i ni sicrhau ein bod yn hala’r arian yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol.

The answer is, ‘yes’, but every Minister would say that about every part of their own portfolios. So, at present, we need to ensure that we spend the money in the most effective manner.

[21] **Christine Chapman:** Gwenda is next and then Alun.

[22] **Gwenda Thomas:** Bore da, Brif Weinidog. A ydych yn cyd-fynd â mi—ac yr ydych wedi rhoi esiamplau o ffyrdd eraill i fuddsoddi yn y Gymraeg—bod ‘Mwy na geiriau’ wedi dangos ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i’r iaith Gymraeg, a bod datblygu’r cynllun ar y cyd rhwng y gwasanaeth iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn esiampl wych inni ei dilyn, a bod ‘Mwy na Geiriau’ wedi datblygu gydag ymrwymiad llawn i’r Gymraeg ac i hybu defnydd o’r Gymraeg yn y gwasanaethau hynny?

Gwenda Thomas: Good morning, First Minister. Do you agree with me—and you have given examples of other ways in which funds are invested in the Welsh language—that ‘More than just words’ has shown the Welsh Government’s commitment to the Welsh language, and that developing that scheme jointly between the health service and social care was an excellent example that we should follow, and that ‘More than just words’ has developed with a full commitment to the Welsh language and to promoting the use of the Welsh language within those services?

[23] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny wedi digwydd ac, wrth gwrs, mae’n bwysig dros ben ei fod yn digwydd. Fel rydych chi’n gwybod, mae llawer o bobl sy’n fwy cyfforddus yn y Gymraeg nac yn Saesneg ac mae rhai pobl, yn enwedig y rheiny sy’n cael rhyw fath o niwed i’r ymennydd, yn colli’u Saesneg ac yr wyf wedi gweld hynny’n digwydd. Wrth gwrs, mae’n bwysig dros ben eu bod yn cael gwasanaeth yn y Gymraeg er mwyn iddynt allu deall yn gwmws beth yw eu sefyllfa nhw. Mae’n galonogol iawn i weld beth sydd wedi digwydd gyda ‘Mwy na geiriau’, er mwyn sicrhau bod pawb yng Nghymru, beth bynnag yw eu hiaith, yn gallu cael y gwasanaeth y dylent ei gael.

The First Minister: That is the case and, of course, it is extremely important that that does happen. As you know, there are many people who are more comfortable speaking Welsh than English and some people, particularly those who have had some kind of brain damage, lose the English language and I have actually seen it happen. Therefore, it is exceptionally important that they receive a service through the medium of Welsh so that they can understand exactly what their position is. It is extremely encouraging to see what has happened with ‘More than just words’, in order to ensure that everybody in Wales, whatever language they speak, can receive the service that they should.

[24] **Alun Davies:** Wrth ymateb i gwestiynau, Brif Weinidog, rydych wedi bod yn awyddus i bwysleisio’r ffaith bod y Llywodraeth yn edrych ar Gymry Cymraeg fel pobl a bod dylanwadau gwahanol ar y bobl hynny ac ar eu defnydd o’r iaith Gymraeg. Mae hynny’n awgrymu, ac yr ydych wedi derbyn hyn, fod sawl cyllideb sy’n cael impact ar y Gymraeg, a’r ffordd yr ydym yn cefnogi’r Gymraeg fel Llywodraeth. A ydych yn hyderus bod y cynllunio yn ddigon tryloyw i ni ddeall impact y toriadau mewn gwahanol adrannau o’r Llywodraeth er mwyn inni ddeall yr impact ar y Gymraeg o benderfyniadau gwahanol gan Weinidogion

Alun Davies: In responding to questions, First Minister, you have been keen to emphasise the fact that the Government is looking at Welsh speakers as people and that there are different influences on those people and on their use of the Welsh language. That suggests, and you have accepted this, that there are a number of budget lines that have an impact on the Welsh language and how we support the Welsh language as a Government. Are you confident that the planning is sufficiently transparent for us to understand the impact of cuts in different Government departments in order to understand the impact on the Welsh language

gwahanol?

of the different decisions taken by different Ministers?

[25] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Rydym yn gwneud hynny ac mae'n bwysig dros ben ein bod yn gwneud asesiadau impact o'r effaith ar yr iaith Gymraeg. O 2015-16, bydd yn rhaid i Weinidogion ystyried yr iaith fel rhan o'r broses o gymryd penderfyniadau ac, wrth gwrs, bydd dyletswydd arnynt i hybu'r iaith a sicrhau bod pobl yn defnyddio'r iaith. Rydym yn aros am y safonau cyntaf; byddant gyda ni erbyn mis Mawrth y flwyddyn nesaf. Ynglŷn â'r flwyddyn hon, cafodd pob adran ganllawiau er mwyn iddyn nhw allu asesu'r impact ar yr iaith pan roedden nhw'n paratoi eu cyllidebau drafft, ac, wrth gwrs, maen nhw wedi gorfod gwneud asesiadau o ran beth fyddai'r impact yn y dyfodol, a'r effaith ar yr iaith, pan oedden nhw'n ystyried penderfyniadau cyllidol.

The First Minister: We do that and it is extremely important that we undertake impact assessments of the impact on the Welsh language. From 2015-16, Ministers will have to consider the language as part of the process of taking decisions and, of course, they will be duty bound to promote the language and ensure that people use it. We are awaiting the first standards; they will be with us by March next year. As regards this year, every department was given guidance so that they could assess the impact on the language when they were preparing their draft budgets, and, of course, they have had to undertake assessments on what the impact could be in the future, and the effect on the language, when they were making financial decisions.

10:15

[26] **Alun Davies:** A ydych chi'n hyderus bod y system yn gweithio?

Alun Davies: Are you confident that the system is working?

[27] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydw, ond bydd hi'n cael ei chryfhau y flwyddyn nesaf ac, wrth gwrs, byddwn ni'n sicrhau bod system fwy cyson, o achos y dyletswyddau a fydd yn cael eu rhoi arnom ni gan y comisiynydd ei hun.

The First Minister: Yes, but it will be strengthened next year and, of course, we will ensure that there is a more consistent system, because of the duties that will be imposed by the commissioner.

[28] **Alun Davies:** Os ydych chi'n mynd i gryfhau rhywbeth, rydych chi'n gwybod bod gwendidau yno, felly byddai'n help petawn ni'n deall beth rydych chi'n eu gweld fel y gwendidau yn y system bresennol.

Alun Davies: If you need to strengthen something, you know that there are weaknesses there, so it would be useful if we could understand what you see as weaknesses in the current system.

[29] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Y system ar hyn o bryd yw bod pob adran yn cael canllawiau. O'r flwyddyn ariannol 2015-16, bydd goblygiadau statudol, felly bydd hynny'n mynd â ni gam ymlaen, ac wedyn, wrth wneud hynny, bydd yn cryfhau beth sy'n iawn ar hyn o bryd.

The First Minister: The system at present is that every department is given guidance. From the financial year 2015-16, there will be statutory implications, and so that will be a step forward and, in so doing, that will strengthen what we have at present.

[30] **Alun Davies:** A ydych chi'n gwybod faint sy'n cael ei wario ar y Gymraeg yn ei gyfanrwydd?

Alun Davies: Do you know how much money is spent on the Welsh language in totality?

[31] **Y Prif Weinidog:** I gyd, os edrychwn ni ar y BELs i gyd, mae gennym ni tua £25,626,000. Dyna'r swm cynhwysfawr

The First Minister: If we look at all the BELs, we have about £25,626,000. That is the quantum that is being spent, between the

o'r hyn sy'n cael ei hala rhwng yr iaith Gymraeg, y comisiynydd a hefyd addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

Welsh language, the commissioner and also Welsh-medium education.

[32] **Alun Davies:** Ond, os yw Gweinidogion yn gwneud asesiadau ar impact, buasai rhywun yn meddwl bod gwariant mewn adrannau gwahanol i sicrhau bod gan bobl wasanaethau trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, nid yr hyn sy'n dod o dan gyllidebau lle mae'r iaith Gymraeg yn rhan o'r teitl yn unig yw'r gwariant ar y Gymraeg; mae gwariant yn y gyllideb iechyd ac yn y gyllideb sgiliau, er enghraifft. Felly, a ydyn ni'n gwybod beth yw cyfanswm y gwariant i gefnogi'r Gymraeg gan Lywodraeth Cymru?

Alun Davies: But, if Ministers carry out impact assessments, then one would expect that there would be expenditure in different departments in order to ensure that securing services through the medium of Welsh was achieved. So, expenditure on the Welsh language does not simply fall into the budgets where the Welsh language forms part of the title; there is expenditure in the health budget and in the skills budget, for example. So, do we know what the quantum of expenditure is to support the Welsh language by the Welsh Government?

[33] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hi'n wir i ddweud, os ydych chi'n ystyried pob adran, bod hynny'n digwydd. Mae hi'n anodd iawn i dorri lawr y ffigurau ar gyfer pob adran, yn enwedig, er enghraifft, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac iechyd, achos, wrth gwrs, beth mae'r adrannau yn ei wneud yw hala'r arian hwn fel rhan o'u cyllidebau nhw. Mae'r un peth yn wir, er enghraifft, gyda'r system gynllunio. Mewn un ffordd, roedd rhyw fath o wariant ar TAN 20, wrth gofio amser y swyddogion, ond os ydyn ni'n edrych ar y swm rydyn ni'n gallu ei roi o flaen y pwyllgor, y £25 miliwn, wel, dyna'r swm isaf achos, ar ben hynny, mae adrannau yn prif ffrydio'r iaith drwy'r gwaith maen nhw'n ei wneud, a byddan nhw'n hala pecynnau o'u harian eu hunain ym mhob adran.

The First Minister: It is true to say that, if you consider every department, that is true. It is very difficult to disaggregate the figures for every department, particularly with social services and health, because, of course, what the departments do is spend this funding as part of their own budgets. The same is true with the planning system, for example. In one way, there was some kind of expenditure on TAN 20, bearing in mind the officials' time, but, if you look at how much we can actually present to the committee, the £25 million, well, that is the absolute minimum because, on top of that, there is mainstreaming of the language through the work that they do, and they would be spending packages of their own funding in every department.

[34] **Alun Davies:** Nid yw Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg yn fudiad rwy fel arfer yn ei ddyfynnu, ond roeddwn i'n darllen tystiolaeth y gymdeithas i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid—rwy'n credu mai Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg ddywedodd hyn—ac roedd yn cymharu gwariant fel hyn gyda gwariant yng Ngwlad y Basg, ac yn dweud bod y gwariant yn y fan hon yn isel iawn, iawn pan fyddwch yn cymharu gwariant gan lywodraethau gwahanol ar ieithoedd lleiafrifol, lle bynnag maen nhw. Mae hi'n anodd iawn i ni wybod beth yw gwariant y Llywodraeth, am y rhesymau rydych chi wedi eu rhoi, ac rwy'n derbyn rhywfaint o hynny—nid wyf yn ei dderbyn i gyd. Rwy'n credu bod mwy y mae'r Llywodraeth yn gallu ei wneud, ond mae hi'n anodd iawn i'r Llywodraeth, yn

Alun Davies: Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg is not usually an organisation that I would quote, but I did read its evidence to the Finance Committee—I think that it was Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg that said this—and it was comparing expenditure here and expenditure in the Basque Country, and stated that expenditure here was extremely low in comparison with expenditure by different governments on minority languages, wherever they may be. It is very difficult for us to know what Government expenditure is, for the reasons that you have already outlined, and I accept that to a certain extent—I do not accept it fully. I think that there is more that the Government could do, but it is very difficult for a Government, first of all, to be transparent about expenditure,

gyntaf, i fod yn dryloyw amboutu gwariant ac, yn ail, i ni ddeall gwariant, oni bai ein bod ni'n deall y gwariant a'r gwaith gan bortffolios gwahanol y tu mewn i'r Llywodraeth.

and, secondly, for us to understand expenditure, unless we can also understand the expenditure and work within the different portfolios within Government.

[35] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Na, mae hynny'n wir, ond a bod yn deg, ni fyddem yn dod yn agos at wariant Gwlad y Basg. Byddem ni'n gorfod mynd lan i rywbeth fel £100 miliwn er mwyn gwneud hynny, ac rydyn ni'n bell o hynny, ac ni fyddai'n rhywbeth y byddem ni'n gallu ei wneud ar hyn o bryd.

The First Minister: No, that is true, but to be fair, we would not come anywhere close to the expenditure of the Basque Country. We would have to be spending somewhere close to a £100 million in order to do that, and we are a long way from that, and it is not something that we could do at present.

[36] **Alun Davies:** Nid wyf yn awgrymu ein bod yn mynd lan at y lefel honno o wariant; beth rwy'n ei wneud yw trio gwneud y gymhariaeth o wybod beth yw'r gwariant mewn un system llywodraeth, a pheidio gwybod beth yw'r gwariant yn ein system ni.

Alun Davies: I am not suggesting that we do go up to that level of expenditure; what I am doing is trying to make that comparison in knowing what expenditure is within one system of government, and not knowing what the expenditure is in ours.

[37] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n anodd gwybod, wrth gwrs, sut maen nhw'n cyfri'r ffordd y maen nhw'n hala arian ar yr iaith yng Ngwlad y Basg. A ydyn nhw'n cyfri bob ceiniog maen nhw'n hala fel Llywodraeth, neu a oes rhyw fath o gyllideb annibynnol ganddyn nhw sydd yn delio â'r iaith? Ond, ni allaf ddweud, wrth gwrs, ein bod ni'n agos atynt o ran y ffordd rydym yn hala arian, ac ni fyddai'n bosibl i wneud hynny, yn enwedig ar hyn o bryd.

The First Minister: It is difficult, of course, to know how they count the way in which they spend money on the language in the Basque Country. Do they count every penny that they spend as a Government, or do they have some kind of independent budget that deals with the language? But, I cannot say, of course, that we are anywhere near to that expenditure, and it would not be possible to do that, particularly now.

[38] **Peter Black:** First Minister, you say that every department was given guidance as to how to assess the impact of their decisions on the Welsh language, yet the strategic integrated impact assessment document just has one paragraph on the Welsh language, which is in relation to the Welsh language action of the education department. It appears that in assessing the impact of the budget on a whole range of Welsh Government priorities, no other department actually put anything in this document as to how their actions would impact on the Welsh language. Is there inconsistency or did they just ignore what you told them?

[39] **The First Minister:** No; clearly, they do not ignore what they are told. They are required to follow the guidance that is issued. Of course, when the duties are imposed, it will be, I suppose, clearer in terms of them understanding that they have a statutory obligation to consider the effect on the Welsh language. What we are doing, of course, is preparing them for that moment in time and issuing guidance to ensure that they do, of course, take the Welsh language into consideration.

[40] **Ms Webb:** We have been working over the past year to develop an integrated impact assessment tool. A synopsis of that was published on 13 September, but we are encouraged by the work across Government, because, in terms of spending, we are trying to understand the impact of the spend. Sometimes, a small amount of spend has much greater impact and much stronger outcomes. So, we are encouraged by the way that divisions and departments are starting to look at Welsh language spend, but it is the start of a journey because we only published the implementation plan, in terms of improving how we look at the Welsh language

internally, last year, so there is a way to go, but we are encouraged by the improvements that departments are already making in terms of how they review and assess that spend.

[41] **Peter Black:** Clearly, from our perspective, there is a lot of paddling going on underwater and not a lot being seen above water. Would it not be reasonable to expect that this document would have reflected some of that activity, so that all departments would have said what the impact of their decisions would have been on the Welsh language?

[42] **The First Minister:** I think that that is a reasonable point to make, and we will need to make sure, in the next stage, when this happens again, that there is a greater reflection of the work that is actually, as you put it, taking place under the water.

[43] **Peter Black:** May I ask whether you can provide any specific examples of how funding for major programme for government commitments have been adjusted to take account of the Welsh language?

[44] **The First Minister:** It is for each department to illustrate that, but let me give you an example of primary legislation. The Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill will encompass much that will be able to help the language and, of course, we continue to be open to practical suggestions with regard to the planning Bill as well. So, we will always consider, on an ongoing basis, how to strengthen the language, even in areas—departments, for example—where it may not be so obvious. If you look at housing, one of the things that can strengthen the language in a particular area is an increase in the availability of affordable housing. We have our targets in terms of building affordable houses and that is one area where there can be a very beneficial impact on the language, as those affordable houses go up.

[45] **Peter Black:** Has the Minister for housing been directing funding towards areas where the Welsh language is strong to try to encourage more affordable homes in those areas? For example, the empty homes initiatives.

[46] **The First Minister:** The—

[47] **Peter Black:** The empty homes initiatives, for example.

[48] **The First Minister:** We target the whole of Wales, but we are more than mindful of the fact that, in many parts of Wales, the real problem is that people have found it difficult to live in the areas that they are from. The only way that you can really resolve that is to make sure that more affordable housing is available to them and that is very much something that, working with the local authorities, we want to achieve.

[49] **Peter Black:** Of course, the other way to sustain strong Welsh language areas is to try to create jobs in those areas. Is the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport, for example, looking specifically at how she can direct jobs in that direction?

[50] **The First Minister:** Yes, she is. Committee members will be aware of the Teifi valley pilot project. One of the things that we picked up in the *Cynhadledd Fawr* was the need to make sure that we do not just help people to get jobs, but that we ensure that existing businesses operate more bilingually than they do now. We chose the Teifi valley as a particular area to see how this would work through. That local growth zone is the pilot project for making sure that more businesses operate bilingually, and then of course provide more jobs for local people. So, it is that pilot project that will lead to other projects in the future.

[51] **Christine Chapman:** I have a couple of supplementary questions from Members now. Alun Davies is first and then Jocelyn.

[52] **Alun Davies:** Roeddwn i eisiau dychwelyd at yr ymateb yr oeddech wedi'i rhoi ar ddeddfwriaeth. Rwy'n gwybod nad yw hyn yn sesiwn bolisi ac nid wyf eisiau crwydro i gyfeiriad polisi, ond yr oeddwn yn *taken* gan eich ymateb i gwestiwn Rhodri Glyn Thomas yn gynharach pan oeddech yn sôn amboutu impact mewnfudo ar yr iaith Gymraeg mewn gwahanol gymunedau. Ond, wrth gwrs, yn ystod cyfnod pan nad yw gwariant fel y byddai bron pob un ohonom yn y fan hon eisiau iddo fod, mae'r ffordd o sicrhau cryfder ar gyfer y Gymraeg yn y dyfodol yw drwy ddefnyddio dull gwahanol, sef deddfwriaeth. Mae dau Bil, y Bil Cynllunio (Cymru) a'r Bil Llesiant Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol (Cymru), lle mae hynny'n bosibl, ac rwy'n cymryd, o'ch ymateb, eich bod yn bwriadu ystyried sut y gallwn gryfhau sefyllfa'r Gymraeg trwy ddefnyddio'r Biliau hynny.

Alun Davies: I wanted to return to the response that you gave on legislation. I know that this is not a policy session and I do not want to stray into policy, but I was taken by your response to Rhodri Glyn Thomas's question earlier when you mentioned the impact of in-migration on the Welsh language within different communities. However, of course, at a time when expenditure is not what virtually every one of us here would want it to be, there is a means of ensuring resilience for the Welsh language in the future by using a different approach, namely legislation. There are two Bills, the Planning (Wales) Bill and the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill, where that is possible, and I assume, from your response, that you do intend to consider how we can strengthen the position of the Welsh language through the use of those Bills.

[53] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Ie, mae hynny'n iawn. Mae'n rhwyddach o dan Bil cenedlaethau'r dyfodol. O ran y Bil cynllunio, rwyf wedi bod yn siarad â grwpiau fel Dyfodol i'r Iaith am hyn ac mae syniadau ganddynt y mae'n rhaid i ni eu hystyried, ond sut ydych chi'n cael effaith ymarferol ar yr iaith Gymraeg? Dyna sy'n bwysig mewn unrhyw Bil. Hefyd, ble rydych chi'n dodi'r ffin rhwng polisi sy'n cael ei rhoi mewn canllawiau a chyfraith sy'n edrych ar strwythur mwy na pholisi? Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, rydym yn agored i unrhyw syniadau ymarferol, ac y byddai hynny'n dal i fod yn wir tra bod y Biliau'n mynd drwy'r Cynulliad.

The First Minister: Yes, that is true. It is easier under the future generations Bill. In terms of the planning Bill, we have been talking to groups such as Dyfodol i'r Iaith about this and it has ideas that we must consider, but how do you have a practical impact on the Welsh language? That is what is important in any Bill. Also, where do you draw the line between policies that are put into guidance and law that looks at structure more than policy? However, as I said, we are open to any practical ideas, and that will remain the case as the Bills go through the Assembly.

[54] **Christine Chapman:** Jocelyn is next.

[55] **Jocelyn Davies:** I wanted to explore the issue of the housing that you mentioned. Are you telling us that you are prioritising affordable housing in traditionally Welsh-speaking areas?

[56] **The First Minister:** No. We prioritise housing in areas that need it. What we do know is, of course, that, by providing funding for affordable housing, that has a tremendously beneficial effect on the Welsh language. So, no, it would not be right to say that we are prioritising certain parts of Wales above others, but we do realise how important it is to make sure those houses are available.

[57] **Jocelyn Davies:** Okay. The other thing that I wanted to ask, following on from the questions from Alun Davies earlier, about how much you are spending on the Welsh language and how difficult it is to assess that, is: can you tell us how much you are spending in support

of the English language? That is the other side of the coin, is it not? If you get into—

[58] **The First Minister:** It is a good point, but I think that we have to understand that the situation of the two languages is very different. English is not under pressure in Wales and English has many ways of replicating itself through the media and is the most powerful language in the world. I do not think that anything we spend on the English language is going to make much difference to the English language's future. We have to understand, as I know the Member does, that there are particular pressures on a language with 500,000 speakers. It is our job to make sure, even in difficult financial times, that we are able to provide as much support as possible.

[59] **Christine Chapman:** Rhodri is next.

[60] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nid wyf yn meddwl mai dyna oedd pwynt y cwestiwn gan Jocelyn Davies, oherwydd mae gwariant ar y Saesneg yn ymwneud â bron popeth yr ydych yn ei wneud fel Llywodraeth ac felly mae'r gymhariaeth rhwng yr hyn yr ydych yn buddsoddi yn y Gymraeg a'r hyn yr ydych yn buddsoddi yn y Saesneg—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I do not think that that was the point of Jocelyn Davies's question, because expenditure on the English language relates to virtually everything that you do as a Government and so the comparison between what you invest in the Welsh language and what you invest in the English language—

[61] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes cyllideb benodol ar gyfer yr iaith Saesneg, nac oes; mae hynny'n wir.

The First Minister: There is no specific budget for the English language; that is true.

[62] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nid dyna oedd fy nghwestiwn i. Fy nghwestiwn i, yn dilyn y pwynt a wnaed gan Alun Davies ynghylch y Bil cynllunio, yw: rydych chi wedi dweud eich bod fel Llywodraeth yn agored i ystyried y posibilrwydd o gynnwys y Gymraeg un ai yn y Bil cynllunio neu yn y Bil cenedlaethau'r dyfodol. A yw hynny'n golygu, er nad ydych wedi ei chynnwys yn y Biliau hynny, na fyddech fel Llywodraeth o reidrwydd yn gwrthod gwelliannau a fyddai'n cael eu cyflwyno ar hynny, ac y byddech yn fodlon eu hystyried?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: That was not my question. My question, following the point made by Alun Davies on the planning Bill, is: you have said that you, as a Government, are open to considering the possibility of including the Welsh language either in the planning Bill or in the future generations Bill. Does that mean that, although you have not included it in those Bills, you would not, as a Government, necessarily reject amendments that may be tabled on that, and that you would be willing to consider them?

[63] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Os ydynt yn ymarferol—dim problem. Y broblem sydd wedi bod hyd yn hyn yw bod popeth sydd wedi cael ei ddweud—wel, nid popeth; mae rhai syniadau yr ydym yn gorfod eu hystyried, ond, gyda llawer ohonynt, mae'n anodd iawn gwybod beth yn gwmws maent yn eu gwneud. Mae pobl wedi dweud wrthyf fod yn rhaid i'r Bil cynllunio ddweud rhywbeth am yr iaith Gymraeg. Wel, nid wyf cweit yn deall beth mae hynny'n ei feddwl. Os yw'n dweud rhywbeth, nid yw hynny'n meddwl y bydd rhywbeth ymarferol yn digwydd ar y ddaear. Felly, i mi, yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw ein bod yn ystyried, yn gyntaf, y

The First Minister: If they are practical—no problem. The problem that we have had to date is that everything that has been said—well, not everything; there are some ideas that we still need to consider, but, with many of them, it is very difficult to know exactly what their impact would be. Some people have said to me that the planning Bill must say something about the Welsh language. Well, I do not quite understand what that means. If it says something, then that does not mean that something practical will happen on the ground. So, for me, what is important is that, first, we consider things that can strengthen the language, and that is

pethau sy'n gallu cryfhau'r iaith, ac y mae hynny'n iawn, ac, yn ail, sicrhau nad oes llawer o bolisi yn y Bil cynllunio, oherwydd strwythur y system gynllunio y mae'r Bil yn delio ag ef; mae polisi, fel arfer, mewn canllawiau. Wrth ystyried y problemau hynny, mae syniadau wedi dod, fel y dywedais, o Dyfodol i'r Iaith, er enghraifft, y byddwn yn leicio eu hystyried yn fwy. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n rhwydd dweud, ar yr un llaw, ein bod yn mo'yn i'r Bil Cynllunio (Cymru) hybu'r iaith, heb ystyried ym mha ffordd y gall hynny ddigwydd mewn gwirionedd; dyna'r hyn y mae'n rhaid inni reslo ag ef.

right, and, secondly, to ensure that the pPlanning Bill does not contain a lot of policy, because it is the structure of the planning system that the Bill deals with; the policy is usually in the guidance. In considering those problems, there are ideas such as those that, as I said, have come from Dyfodol i'r Iaith, for example, that I would wish to consider further. However, it is not easy to say that, on the one hand, we want the Planning (Wales) Bill to promote the language without considering how that can happen in reality; that is what we need to wrestle with.

10:30

[64] **Christine Chapman:** We are about halfway through now, and I know that other Members want to come in. Gwyn, do you want to come in?

[65] **Gwyn R. Price:** Good morning, First Minister. Could you tell me whether the Welsh Government has undertaken any assessment of the likely impact on the Welsh Language Commissioner's resources as a result of the regulatory work needed after the standards are introduced in March 2015? How can the First Minister's paper claim that the costs for organisations of complying with standards are likely to be covered by existing Welsh language scheme budgets, while simultaneously conceding that the regulatory impact assessment cannot be robust until the final standards are introduced?

[66] **The First Minister:** Well, if we look at the first stage of the standards that will be introduced in March of next year, much of those standards will, in the main, apply to organisations that already have Welsh language schemes in place. The question was whether there has been a formal impact assessment. There has not been a formal impact assessment, mainly due to the nature of the organisations that will be affected—Welsh Ministers, local authorities and national parks. They will be the ones subject to the first set of standards, and they already have schemes in place. Those schemes have been agreed and monitored by the Welsh Language Commissioner, so we do not expect that there will be much of an impact, either on the commissioner or those bodies, because, for the first set of standards, they should be doing this already.

[67] **Christine Chapman:** May I ask, First Minister, if the standards do not cost more to implement than Welsh language schemes, what additional outcomes do you expect their introduction to lead to?

[68] **The First Minister:** Well, the first set of standards will apply, as I said, to organisations that are already used to developing schemes and are accountable for those schemes. It is a way of ensuring that those who will be affected by the second and third sets of standards have an example that they can look at as to how those standards work. So, introducing those organisations that are most used to the concept at the beginning of the process is a good way of ensuring that others, who are, perhaps, unused to it, become familiar with the concept, because they can see it working on the ground.

[69] **Christine Chapman:** Mark, did you want to come in on this?

[70] **Mark Isherwood:** Yes, thank you. Good morning. Referring to the list published in

January of the schedule to introduce Welsh language standards to the round 2 and 3 organisations, the Welsh Language Commissioner expressed concern that the Welsh Government has not announced time to be allocated in the Senedd to deal with the regulations to make these standards. How do you respond to that concern?

[71] **The First Minister:** The first set of standards will be introduced in March, and the second set by the end of next year.

[72] **Mark Isherwood:** Will you, therefore, be confirming when time will be made available in the Senedd to facilitate that?

[73] **The First Minister:** Yes. That is the timetable for introducing them; obviously, there will need to be time allocated to ensure that they can be taken through.

[74] **Mark Isherwood:** She said that we need clarity 'soon'. Do you have any idea how soon that 'soon' will be?

[75] **The First Minister:** This morning—March 2015 for the first set of standards, and by the end of next year for the second. Of course, the commissioner herself is part of this process, and she has been part of the process of developing the standards, and we have said in the past that that is the timetable that we would adhere to.

[76] **Mark Isherwood:** What dialogue is the Welsh Government having with the round 2 and 3 organisations regarding this?

[77] **The First Minister:** The commissioner will be having those discussions as well, because the commissioner's role will be to regulate those standards, and, of course, the tribunal will be in place as well. In terms of the Government's role, I can say that, with regard to the first round of standards, a regulatory impact assessment was conducted based on the proposed standards. Eighteen of the 26 organisations affected responded; those responses showed general support for the introduction of those standards. It is pretty fair to say that the responses varied in their assessment of what the cost would be of complying with those standards, but we would expect those organisations to absorb the cost within their own budgets, given the fact that this is something they should already have been doing.

[78] **Christine Chapman:** Thank you. Jocelyn is next.

[79] **Jocelyn Davies:** I wanted to ask you about the reduction in the Welsh in education BEL. What percentage of seven-year-olds will be in Welsh-medium education by next year?

[80] **The First Minister:** Well, we have our targets, of course, to ensure that there is an increase in the number of young people in education, particularly those who are in the foundation phase. I launched a scheme in Blackwood, in fact—at the end of last year, if I remember rightly; it may have been earlier than that—to encourage parents to take up Welsh-medium education, particularly in areas where the language had not been a community language for many, many years. Of course, we do want to see the number increase in time.

[81] **Jocelyn Davies:** So, the hope was, or the aspiration or target would be, that 25% of seven year olds, according to your strategy, would be in Welsh-medium education. That is not the case, so there is a question about whether the reduction of funding will help you achieve that aspiration. Of course, there is an argument about whether that is because of a lack of demand or a lack of places, because people get in touch with me—not in Blackwood, I have to say—and say, 'I wanted a Welsh-medium education for my child, but the place wasn't available'. Of course, there is the cost of teaching that child if they go to an English-medium school, is there not?

[82] **The First Minister:** That is true. In terms of what we are doing to encourage parents to consider Welsh-medium education for their children, particularly young children, if you look at Twf and Tyfu and 'Mae dy Gymraeg di'n grêt', these are all schemes that are designed, I suppose, indirectly to encourage people to consider Welsh-medium education for their children. If they are speaking Welsh to their children at a young age, and going to the *meithrin* and beyond that, that will be a natural process for them. I think that the reality is that there are problems in some parts of Wales when it comes to providing places, because demand has outstripped supply. Local authorities are now, of course, obliged to produce plans to deal with how they plan to meet this demand. It is fair to say that some of them have produced satisfactory plans, and some of them have plans that are still work in progress.

[83] **Jocelyn Davies:** So, if the demand was met, do you think you would have met that aspiration of 25% of seven year olds by next year?

[84] **The First Minister:** We need the local authorities to be able to provide the places; that is the reality of it.

[85] **Jocelyn Davies:** I am going to try to put my question—. Perhaps I am not asking it in a clear way. Do you know—perhaps you do not know—whether, if the demand was met, we would have 25% of seven year olds?

[86] **The First Minister:** It is very difficult to know what the actual figure will be next year. We can promote the language, but much of it depends, of course, on ensuring that we have in place robust plans from local authorities to meet that demand.

[87] **Jocelyn Davies:** So, what we do know is, if all the demand was met, we would have more children in Welsh-medium education, because we know that there are people who want Welsh-medium education that currently cannot get it.

[88] **The First Minister:** I think that is right.

[89] **Jocelyn Davies:** So, how does this reduction in the Welsh in education funding help in relation to that?

[90] **The First Minister:** Well, bear in mind, of course, that we have protected schools funding, and, as you have already said, this is part of schools funding—a child would have to be educated anyway, regardless of language—and we have put in the 1% protection for schools across Wales, so schools funding is protected. I would expect local authorities to make a provision for demand in their area based on that protection, as well.

[91] **Jocelyn Davies:** Okay, so the protection of the schools budget helps Welsh-medium education, but equally English-medium education, it is just a protection—

[92] **The First Minister:** Yes, it does.

[93] **Jocelyn Davies:** So, how does the reduction in this BEL help Welsh in education, because that is the budget that you have reduced?

[94] **The First Minister:** Well, it is right to say that the budget has been reduced. There is no doubt about that.

[95] **Jocelyn Davies:** I have just asked you to justify it, really.

[96] **The First Minister:** Well, first of all, the Welsh in education grant will be transferred

to the proposed education improvement grant, and we have to bear in mind that the Welsh-medium education strategy is a long-term strategy. It is right to say that the Welsh in education budget has decreased by about £600,000; that much is true. It is a challenge, I am not going to run away from that; that much is true as well. That said, the budget is still substantial. We are talking about £18.59 million still within the budget itself, and I would expect local authorities, notwithstanding the reduction in that budget, to meet demand from the money they get through the RSG.

[97] **Jocelyn Davies:** Okay then, so we can map that as we go forward, because that is something we can count—how many children are in classes in Welsh-medium schools—to see how that target is met. What about Welsh for adults? Have you done any analysis on how many classes will now be lost because of the funding cut?

[98] **Dr Turner:** What we tried to do with the cut in Welsh for adults was work with the centres to identify ways of making efficiency savings that minimised the impact on learners. For example, one of the findings of the review we had a year ago was that the current system for assessment is not really adding value. So, we have agreed with the centres that we will cease one type. The exams will continue, the assessments in terms of ability will continue, but the other element of assessments is not adding value, so we have agreed with the centres that we will finish that element early. That releases some of the money to contribute towards the savings. The centres are also identifying administrative savings to try to minimise the impact on learners, but the reality is that there will be an impact on learners. We are trying to protect the learners who are already in the system to make sure that they are supported as they continue their journey through the system. The impact initially will be on people coming into the system for the first time. We are also asking the centres to be effective and efficient in the way they organise their beginners' classes. At the moment, we know that a lot of classes are organised, they then see how many people have signed up, and they have to rationalise then during the year. So, there are some efficiency savings to be made there that will minimise the impact on learners as well.

[99] **Jocelyn Davies:** So, will be able to count, at some point, if there has been a reduction in the number of people learning? Will we be able to tell?

[100] **Dr Turner:** What the study we commissioned last year said was that we need to make sure that, of the 18,000 learners who go through the system every year, more of them need to be helped to become fluent. That is our emphasis at the moment: how can we improve the system and support people who are in the system by introducing informal ways of using the language in day-to-day life, to give them the opportunity to use their language and become more fluent? That is our priority at the moment.

[101] **Jocelyn Davies:** It might be a priority, but if the budget cut prevents new people coming in, then those learners will tail off over time—if you have to pay where you would not have had to pay before. Will we be able to count if there has been a reduction in new people wanting to learn? This has been something that has risen over time. Will we be able to see that?

[102] **Dr Turner:** Yes, we do gather data. Over time, we will be able to see whether the pattern of people coming in at beginner level will change or not.

[103] **Jocelyn Davies:** If we see a tailing off, First Minister, would you consider reconsidering this budget line?

[104] **The First Minister:** It has to be balanced against the successes we would want to see in the budgets that we have allocated for transmission and for young people. At the moment, I think that it is just about 22% of young people who are assessed at seven years old, in terms

of the assessments made at that stage. That has gone up. It was about 19% 10 years ago, that much is useful. We have to wait and see whether the numbers drop. It is not clear whether that will happen or not, because I think we all know that, with a lot of Welsh for adults classes, people start and they drop off while the course is ongoing. We do not know what effect that will have, but, in difficult financial times, bluntly, we have had to target the money more at young people at this moment in time. Yes, there has been a cut in the Welsh for adults budget.

[105] **Christine Chapman:** I am conscious that we have only about a quarter of an hour left and we have another panel following that. I want to make sure that all Members have the opportunity to come in. So, again, can you be as concise as possible with your questions to give the First Minster the opportunity to answer in a full way? Mike is first.

[106] **Mike Hedges:** [*Inaudible.*]—First Minster, I will ask a question in Welsh. I can do a translation later if needed. [*Laughter.*]

[107] Ar y Gymraeg ar ôl 18, pam mae'r ddarpariaeth o gyrsiau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg mor gyfyngedig yn ein prifysgolion?

On Welsh post 18, why is the provision of courses through the medium of Welsh so limited in our universities?

[108] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Diolch i'r Aelod am y cwestiwn. Mae rôl i'r Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol sicrhau bod cyrsiau ar gael yn y Gymraeg yn ein prifysgolion. Un o'r problemau rydym wedi'i hwynebu yw bod llawer o bobl yn mynd o'r ysgol i'r brifysgol ac wedyn nid ydynt yn astudio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg o gwbl yng Nghymru.

The First Minister: I thank the Member for the question. There is a role for the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol to ensure that courses are available through the medium of Welsh in our universities. One of the problems we have faced is that a number of people go from school to university and do not study through the medium of Welsh at all in Wales.

10:45

[109] Mae'r Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol ei hunan yn ystyried, mewn ffordd annibynnol, y rheolaeth a datblygiad o'r iaith y tu fewn i'r system addysg uwch. Mae arian sydd wedi cael ei benodi i'r Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol er mwyn sicrhau bod mwy o astudiaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a hefyd i gefnogi ysgoloriaethau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg hefyd.

The Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol itself is considering, in an independent way, the management and development of the Welsh language within the higher education system. Funding has been allocated to the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol in order to ensure that more studies are undertaken through the medium of Welsh and also to support scholarships through the medium of Welsh, too.

[110] **Christine Chapman:** Thank you. Gwenda is next.

[111] **Gwenda Thomas:** Am I moving on to my questions?

[112] **Christine Chapman:** Yes.

[113] **Gwenda Thomas:** A allwch chi roi enghreifftiau penodol o'r effaith y mae asesiadau effaith ar y Gymraeg wedi'u cael ar benderfyniadau'r gyllideb? Beth yw eich ymateb i honiadau Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg, sy'n dweud nad ydych wedi cynnal

Gwenda Thomas: Could you give us some specific examples of the impact that Welsh language impact assessments have had on budgetary decisions? What is your response to the claims made by Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg, which says that you have not

adolygiad cynhwysfawr o effaith gwariant yr holl bortffolios ar y Gymraeg—ac mae Beth wedi cyffwrdd ar hyn—er gwaethaf y ffaith ichi gytuno i wneud hynny ym mis Chwefror y llynedd?

conducted a comprehensive review of the impact of expenditure across all portfolios on the Welsh language—and Beth has already touched on this—despite the fact that you agreed to do so in February of last year?

[114] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mewn ffordd, gallaf sôn am yr ateb a roddais yn gynharach. Mae hwn yn rhywbeth sydd wedi cael ei wneud gyda phob adran, a bydd yn rhywbeth a fydd yn statudol o 2015 ymlaen. Rydym yn croesawu hynny, wrth gwrs, er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn cael mwy o ddealltwriaeth o'r ffordd yr ydym yn ystyried yr iaith Gymraeg pan ydym yn cymryd penderfyniadau.

The First Minister: In a way, I can refer you to a response I gave earlier. This is something that has been done with every department, and it is something that will be statutory from 2015 onwards. We welcome that, of course, in order to ensure that people have a greater understanding of the way in which we consider the Welsh language when we take decisions.

[115] **Christine Chapman:** Is that okay?

[116] **Gwenda Thomas:** Yes.

[117] **Christine Chapman:** Thank you. Janet, do you want to come in there?

[118] **Janet Finch-Saunders:** Thank you, Chair. This touches on the point that Rhodri Glyn Thomas made earlier and the reason why the planning Bill does not make provision relating to how local authorities consider the Welsh language in planning terms. I can endorse that, during the fairly recent local development plan process, despite elected representatives making very strong representations, the numbers that were forthcoming by your officials would impact negatively on the Welsh language. We were sort of boxed into a corner where we had to accept those numbers. We have the planning Bill and the future generations Bill coming forward, and those are two Bills by which you can really prove that you are committed to promoting the Welsh language. I know that you have made murmurs to Rhodri this morning that you will look at it, but can you give us a commitment this morning? Certainly, the planning Bill really is a good tool and a good vehicle to prove that you are committed to the Welsh language, but also the future generations Bill. Could we have some commitment that you will look at those again?

[119] **The First Minister:** I think I have already answered that question. There is a specific question that the Member asks about population projections. Local authorities are not obliged to follow our population projections if they can provide figures of their own that are based on evidence. That much is correct. It is for them to make that assessment and whether they do or not is a matter for them to answer—

[120] **Janet Finch-Saunders:** [*Inaudible*.]—we have constituents as well, to prove it out, but in the end—

[121] **Christine Chapman:** Janet, let the First Minister answer.

[122] **The First Minister:** If it is evidence based, it is open to local authorities—that is my understanding—to consider that evidence base as well. However, in terms of the planning Bill itself, the issue that we wrestle with is that the planning Bill is a structural Bill. All planning legislation is based on how the planning system operates, not what the planning system should do in terms of policy.

[123] I have heard people say to me that what we need to do is make sure that the language is mentioned in the planning Bill. I am not quite sure what that does, practically. So, in terms

of whether it would appear on the face of the Bill, I do not know what that means, or what effect it would have. That said, as I said, we are open to suggestions as to the structural aspects of the Bill, which could be strengthened as far as the language is concerned. However, again, the language impact assessments will be dealt with through TANs, usually, not as part of a Bill. Once you start doing that, you might as well just include everything in a Bill rather than in planning guidance.

[124] We have made the announcement about the need for local authorities to make the assessment at the start of the LDP process. There is a review process in place for those who are already past that process, but one of the issues raised with me is that some local authorities were under the impression that they could not consider the language at all as part of the planning process. That is not true. What was missing, though, was a widely accepted toolkit for making a language impact assessment. That is what has been developed.

[125] I think that there was a fear among some local authorities—and I am going to be generous—that, because there was no widely accepted toolkit, if they tried to take the language into account, the inspectorate would overturn that. Actually giving them the tools that they need in order to make those language assessments is important. Some local authorities have already done this. I think that Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council is one, where it has looked at particular areas of language sensitivity. My impression is that most local authorities, if they feel comfortable that they have the tools that they need, will use those tools. I am particularly encouraged by what has happened in Carmarthenshire. Carmarthenshire is an authority with an unfortunate history when it comes to the language. There are many in this room who will know that, some years ago, the language was a political football between different parties, if I can be quite honest about it. That has gone. I am glad to see that the commission in Carmarthenshire has reported on a cross-party basis, and that will help to improve the position of Welsh in Carmarthenshire, not just in the council but in terms of education and ultimately in the planning process as well.

[126] **Janet Finch-Saunders:** I think that, as the LDP was going through, it was more the financial penalties that would be imposed if you did not accept the numbers. It was a really painful process. We did do assessments. We got consultants in, and we were saying, 'You are really going to undermine the Welsh language here'. I just think that you have got the vehicle now to be able to do something about it.

[127] **The First Minister:** Ultimately, of course, it is a matter for the inspector, because the inspector has a decision-taking role as part of the LDP process that was not there in the unitary development plan process. If the evidence is robust, there is no reason why that evidence would not be accepted. Ultimately, of course, it is a matter for the inspector.

[128] **Christine Chapman:** I have Mike next and then Rhodri.

[129] **Mike Hedges:** Beth sy'n cael ei wneud i amddiffyn yr iaith Gymraeg yn y rhannau hynny o Gymru lle y mae'n iaith gymunedol ar hyn o bryd?

Mike Hedges: What is being done to protect the Welsh language in those parts of Wales where it is a community language at present?

[130] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Nod a sylfaen 'Bwrw Mlaen' yw sicrhau ein bod yn gallu gwneud hynny. Ym mha ffordd ydw i'n mynd i wneud hynny? Wel, sicrhau bod yr arian sy'n cael ei wario ar gynlluniau fel Twf yn cael ei warchod. Mae hynny wedi digwydd. Yn ail, rhaid sicrhau bod pobl yn defnyddio'r iaith a bod ganddynt yr hyder i

The First Minister: The aim and fundamental premise of 'Moving Forward' is to ensure that we can do that. In what way do I do that? Well, by ensuring that the funding spent on schemes such as Twf is protected. That has happened. Secondly, by ensuring that people use the language and that they have the confidence to do so. As I said

wneud hynny. Fel y dywedais o'r blaen, gydag ymgyrchoedd fel Pethau Bychain, mae hynny'n bwysig dros ben. Mae angen hefyd sicrhau bod datblygiad economaidd yn digwydd yn yr ardaloedd hyn. I ddod yn ôl at Ddyffryn Teifi, mae angen defnyddio'r enghraifft honno a gweld sut y gellir ei hymestyn ar draws Cymru yn gyfan gwbl gydag amser.

earlier, with campaigns such as Pethau Bychain, that is extremely important. We also need to ensure that economic development takes place in these areas. To return to the example of the Teifi Valley, we need to use that and see how it can be extended throughout Wales in time.

[131] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Roeddech yn sôn, Brif Weinidog, am yr asesiadau o ran twf yn y boblogaeth. Y gwir amdani oedd bod yr asesiadau a wnaethpwyd yn gwbl gamarweiniol. Yn sir Gaerfyrddin, er enghraifft, roedd yr asesiad o'r angen am dai llawer iawn yn fwy, a bu'n rhaid ailedrych ar y ffigurau hynny. Wrth gwrs, mae'r cynllun datblygu lleol wedi'i seilio ar y ffigurau cynharaf, felly mae llawer iawn gormod o dai wedi'u hadeiladu, ac mae hynny'n mynd i olygu cynnydd yn y mewnlifiad. Rydych eisoes wedi cydnabod bod hynny yn cael effaith andwyol ar y Gymraeg. Sut ydych yn mynd i sicrhau bod yr asesiadau hyn yn mynd i fod yn fwy cywir yn y dyfodol?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: First Minister, you mentioned the assessments in terms of population growth. The truth was that the assessments carried out were entirely misleading. In Carmarthenshire, for example, the assessment in terms of housing need was far greater, and the figures had to be reviewed. Of course, the LDP is based on the earlier projections, and therefore far too many homes have been built, and that will mean an increase in migration. You have already acknowledged that that has a detrimental impact on the Welsh language. How are you going to ensure that these assessments will be more accurate in future?

[132] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Wrth gwrs, mae TAN 20 wedi cael ei adolygu ers hynny, a bydd hynny'n rhoi'r ffordd i awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau eu bod yn gallu cael mwy o nerth wrth wneud asesiadau iaith. Fel y dywedais, os yw awdurdodau lleol yn meddwl bod y ffigurau a roddwyd yn anghywir, mae ffordd ar agor iddynt—ac mae lan i awdurdodau lleol i wneud hwn—sef bod ganddynt gyfle i ailystyried y dystiolaeth os ydynt yn credu bod y ffigurau hynny yn anghywir.

The First Minister: Of course, TAN 20 has been reviewed since then, and that will give local authorities a means of ensuring that they can have greater robustness in the language assessments. However, as I said, if local authorities believe that the figures given are incorrect, there is a way open for local authorities—and it is up to the local authorities to do this—namely that they have an opportunity to reconsider the evidence if they believe that those figures are inaccurate.

[133] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gyda'ch caniatâd chi, Gadeirydd, mae gennyf gwestiwn cyffredinol iawn. Rydym yn dod i ddiwedd y sesiwn hon. Rwy'n ymwybodol o'ch ymrwymiad personol i hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg, a'ch bod yn teimlo'n gryf iawn ynglŷn â hynny. I ryw raddau, mae statws i'r ffaith mai'r Prif Weinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb am y Gymraeg, ond fel rydym i gyd yn gwybod, mae trafodaethau cynhwysfawr iawn yn mynd i ddigwydd dros y misoedd a'r blynyddoedd nesaf ynglŷn â dyfodol y Deyrnas Unedig a datganoli i Gymru. Rydych wedi bod yn flaenllaw wrth hyrwyddo hynny. A ydych yn credu bod yna

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: With your permission, Chair, I have a very general question to ask. We are now coming to the end of this session. I am aware of your personal commitment to the promotion of the Welsh language, and that you feel very strongly about the issue. To a certain extent, there is a degree of status to the fact that it is the First Minister who has responsibility for the Welsh language, but we all know that there will be some comprehensive discussions over the next few months and years on the future of the United Kingdom and devolution to Wales. You have been prominent in promoting that. Do you think

berygl yng nghanol yr holl gyfrifoldebau sydd gennych, ac ymysg y datblygiadau hyn sy'n digwydd, fod y Gymraeg yn mynd i gael ei gosod i'r naill ochr?

that there is a risk amid all the responsibilities that you have, and among these developments that are happening, that the Welsh language is going to be side-lined?

[134] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Gallaf ymdopi. Rwy'n gwybod hynny. Mae'n bwysig dros ben, a diolch am yr hyn a ddywedoch. Mae ymrwymiad yn un peth, ond rwy'n deall ei fod yn bwysig bod ymrwymiad personol yn cael ei droi'n bethau ymarferol sy'n mynd i helpu'r Gymraeg. Mae'n rhywbeth sy'n hanfodol bwysig i mi, a'm cynllun yw cadw'r cyfrifoldeb hyd at yr etholiad. Dyna yw'r cynllun ar hyn o bryd.

The First Minister: I can cope. I know that. It is extremely important, and thanks for your comments. A commitment is one thing, but I understand fully that it is important that a personal commitment is turned into practical things that will assist the Welsh language. It is something that is vitally important to me, and my plan is to retain the responsibility up until the election. That is the plan at present.

[135] **Christine Chapman:** May I thank you, First Minister, and your officials for attending? It has been a very good session this morning. We will send you a transcript of the meeting so that you can check it for factual accuracy. Thank you very much.

[136] The committee will now take a break until 11.10 a.m.

Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 10:55 ac 11:10.
The meeting adjourned between 10:55 and 11:10.

Comisiynydd y Gymraeg: Trafod yr Adroddiad Blynyddol
Welsh Language Commissioner: Consideration of Annual Report

[137] **Christine Chapman:** Good morning, again. The purpose of this session is to consider the Welsh Language Commissioner's annual report 2013-14. So, may I give a very warm welcome to Meri Huws, Welsh Language Commissioner, and to Dyfan Sion, director of policy and research? Welcome to you both. Members will have read the report, so we will go straight into questions. I want to start with some fairly general questions. Obviously, other Members will pick up on the specifics, so I want to ask if you could give me a brief outline of the major steps that you say that your office has taken over the past year to strengthen the Welsh language. Also, could you just say something about the 'significant challenges' that you say still exist in this respect?

[138] **Ms Huws:** Diolch yn fawr. Bore da a diolch am y cyfle i ymddangos o'ch blaen chi eto i drafod ein hadroddiad blynyddol. Mae'n demtasiwn, wrth ateb cwestiwn fel hwnnw, i fynd i mewn i fanylder mawr. Ni wnaf i hynny, ond a gaf i roi ambell i bennawd i chi gan gymryd y byddwch yn dod yn ôl at gwestiynau penodol?

Ms Huws: Thank you. Good morning and thank you for the opportunity to appear before you once again to discuss our annual report. It is a temptation, in answering such a question, to go into very great detail. I will resist that, but could I give you a few headings, assuming that you will return with specific questions?

[139] Un o'r prif feysydd sydd o ddiddordeb ac o bwys i mi fel comisiynydd yw craffu ar ddatblygiadau polisi a deddfwriaeth yma yn y Senedd yn y bae a hefyd yn San Steffan. Mae amryw o ddarnau pwysig o ddeddfwriaeth wedi dod o'n blaenau ni yn ystod y cyfnod rydym yn sôn

One of the main areas of interest and importance for me as a commissioner is to scrutinise policy and legislation developments here in the Senedd in the bay and also in Westminster. There are a number of important pieces of legislation that have come before us during the period that we are

amdano yn y fan hon, yn benodol iawn y Ddeddf Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a Llesiant (Cymru) 2014. Roedd yn braf iawn i fod yn rhan o'r trafodaethau ac i sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn cael sylw yn y darn pwysig hwnnw o ddeddfwriaeth. Rydych chi, ar hyn o bryd, yn ystyried Bil Cynllunio (Cymru), ac mae hwnnw'n ddarn o waith sy'n parhau ac rydym yn dal yn ei graffu. Yn sicr, fe fyddwn ni eisiau trafod y Bil cynllunio wrth iddo symud ymlaen.

covering here, most specifically the Social Services and Well-being (Wales) Act 2014. It was wonderful to be part of those discussions and to ensure that the Welsh language was covered in that important piece of legislation. You are currently considering the Planning (Wales) Bill, which is a piece of work that is ongoing and we continue to scrutinise that. Certainly, we will want to discuss the planning Bill as it progresses.

[140] Felly, mae'r gwaith craffu hwnnw, er mwyn sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn cael ei phrif ffrydio i holl feysydd y Cynulliad, yn aruthrol o bwysig, nid jest bod y Gymraeg yn eistedd mewn bocs polisi sydd â'r Gymraeg arno, ond bod y Gymraeg yn ystyriaeth ar draws pob maes polisi, boed hynny wrth wneud polisi neu wrth bennu cyllidebau. Mae hynny'n reit bwysig.

So, that scrutiny work in order to ensure that the Welsh language is mainstreamed in all areas of the Assembly, is exceptionally important, not just that the Welsh language sits in a policy box, labelled 'Welsh', but that the Welsh language is a consideration across all policy areas, be that in drawing up policy or in finalising budgets. That is very important.

[141] Y gwaith arall sydd wedi bod yn arwyddocaol yn ystod y flwyddyn rydym yn sôn amdani—ac wrth gwrs, ail flwyddyn o weithredu swyddfa'r comisiynydd ydyw, felly rydym yn dal i fod yn gorff ifanc iawn—yw'r gwaith rydym wedi bod yn ei wneud o ran ystyried cwynion gan unigolion nad oedden nhw'n derbyn gwasanaeth neu nid oedd ansawdd y gwasanaeth o ran y Gymraeg yn ddigonol. Yn araf bach, rydym yn gweld y gwaith cwynion hwnnw yn arwain at sefydlu hawliau mwy pendant i Gymry Cymraeg. Wrth sefydlu hawliau, mae pobl yn meithrin hyder, oherwydd eu bod yn teimlo y gallan nhw ddisgwyl gwasanaeth ac y gallan nhw ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg mewn gwahanol sefyllfaoedd.

The other work that has been significant during the year that we are covering today—and of course, it is the second year of the operation of the commissioner's office, so we are still a very young organisation—is the work that we have been doing in considering complaints from individuals who believe that they were not receiving a service or that the service through the medium of Welsh was not adequate. Very slowly, we are seeing that complaints work leading to the establishment of more definite rights for Welsh speakers. In establishing rights, people gain confidence, because they think that they can expect a service and they can use the Welsh language in different circumstances.

[142] Yn drydydd, mae'r gwaith o symud o'r gyfundrefn cynlluniau iaith i osod safonau yn heriol. Mae symud o gyfundrefn sydd wedi'i sefydlu ers 1993, lle mae rhyw 600 o gynlluniau iaith yng Nghymru, i sefyllfa o osod safonau ar sefydliadau yn heriol. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yn y broses honno yw ein bod yn cofio pam rydym yn ei wneud. Nid creu sefyllfa fiwrocrataidd newydd ydym, ond sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn fwy gweladwy a chlywadwy ac yn haws i'w defnyddio yng Nghymru. Mae yn wastad perygl, wrth greu unrhyw strwythur, eich bod yn mynd ar goll yn y fiwrocratiaeth.

Thirdly, the work of moving from the language scheme regime to setting standards is challenging. Moving from a regime that was established in 1993, where there are some 600 language schemes in Wales, to a situation of setting standards for organisations is challenging. What is important in that process is that we bear in mind why we are doing that. We are not trying to create a new bureaucracy, but to ensure that the Welsh language is more visible and more audible and easier to use in Wales. There is always a risk, in creating any new structure, that you get tied up in bureaucracy.

[143] Y pennawd olaf, a rhywbeth sydd yn aruthrol o bwysig i mi, yw'r gwaith rydym yn ei wneud gyda chyrff trydydd sector a'r sector busnes i hwyluso eu defnydd o'r Gymraeg; gwaith sy'n anweladwy, er enghraifft, y gwaith rydym wedi'i wneud gyda Chwaraeon Cymru, ond sydd yn weladwy iawn i'r bobl hynny sydd yn mynd i glwb hwylio neu i glwb hoci.

The final heading, and something that is exceptionally important to me, is the work we do with third sector organisations and the business sector to facilitate their use of the Welsh language. It is work that is often invisible, for example, the work that we have done with Sports Wales, but it is very visible to those people who go to a sailing club or a hockey club.

11:15

[144] Felly, dyna'r prif benawdau. Dyna'r pictiwr mawr a'r effaith ar fywyd unigolion yng Nghymru. Mae i gyd yn heriol, yn enwedig pan fo toriadau mewn cyllidebau i sefydliad, a hefyd i'r sefydliadau yr ydym yn ymwneud â nhw ar draws Cymru. Wedi dweud hynny, rwy'n credu, gyda'r adroddiad blynyddol hwn, ein bod yn gweld sefydliad sy'n dechrau magu traed ac yn dechrau cael cyfeiriad strategol clir iawn. Hynny sy'n bwysig i mi: bod y cyfeiriad strategol hwnnw yn glir ac nad yw'n rhyw fan hyn, fan draw, heb fawr o gyfeiriad.

So, those are the main headings. That is the big picture and the impact that we are having on individuals' lives in Wales. It is all challenging, especially when there are budgetary cuts to an institution and to the institutions that we work with across Wales. Having said that, however, I believe that, with this annual report, we are seeing an institution that is starting to gather pace and starting to get a clear strategic direction. That is important to me: that that strategic direction should be clear rather than being here, there and everywhere, without any real direction.

[145] **Christine Chapman:** Thank you for that overview. I know that other Members will pick up some specifics in the detail. Rhodri has a question.

[146] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Diolch yn fawr, Gadeirydd. Gwnaethoch gyfeirio yn eich rhagarweiniad i'r gwaith y mae swyddfa'r comisiynydd wedi bod yn ei wneud ar y Bil cynllunio. Rwy'n credu eich bod wedi clywed tystiolaeth y Prif Weinidog yn gynharach, pan oedd yn sôn am y Bil cynllunio a hefyd Bil Llesiant Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol (Cymru), gan ddweud ei fod yn agored i ystyried cynnwys y Gymraeg o fewn y naill Bil neu'r llall, neu'r ddau Fil. A ydych yn credu mai cyfrifoldeb y comisiynydd yw cynnig arweiniad i'r Prif Weinidog ar y mater hwn ynglŷn â sut y gellid cynnwys y Gymraeg a diogelu buddiannau'r Gymraeg o fewn y Biliau hynny?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Thank you very much, Chair. You referred in your introduction to the work that the commissioner's office has been doing on the planning Bill. I believe that you heard the First Minister's evidence earlier when he talked about the planning Bill and also the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill, saying that he was open to considering including the Welsh language within either or both Bills. Do you believe that it is the responsibility of the commissioner to offer guidance to the First Minister in this context in terms of how the Welsh language could be included and how the interests of the Welsh language could be safeguarded within those Bills?

[147] **Ms Huws:** Diolch yn fawr am y cwestiwn. Mae Mesur y Gymraeg (Cymru) 2011 yn rhoi cyfrifoldeb statudol arnaf i gynnig cyngor i Lywodraeth Cymru—i Weinidogion Cymru—ar feysydd polisi yn gyffredinol. Mae'r maes cynllunio yn un yr

Ms Huws: Thank you for that question. The Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011 places a statutory responsibility upon me to provide advice to the Welsh Government—to Welsh Ministers—on policy areas in general. The planning area is one that we have looked

ydym wedi edrych arno yn fanwl yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf oherwydd ein bod yn ystyried bod y maes cynllunio yn un sydd yn cael effaith uniongyrchol ar y Gymraeg. Rwyf yn mynd i droi at Dyfan achos ef sydd wedi arwain ar y gwaith hwn yn ystod y flwyddyn er mwyn iddo sôn am y gwaith yr ydym wedi ei fwydo i mewn i'r drafodaeth sydd wedi bod, a'r hyn yr ydym wedi ei fwydo i'r Prif Weinidog, yn benodol, ac i'r Gweinidog sy'n ymwneud â chynllunio.

at in detail over the past year because we believe that planning is an issue that has a direct impact on the Welsh language. I will turn to Dyfan because he has led on this work during the year. He can tell you about the work that we have fed into the discussion that has been ongoing, and what we fed to the First Minister particularly, and to the Minister responsible for planning.

[148] **Mr Sion:** Ein prif ffocws ni, fel sefydliad, yn y maes cynllunio yw cael y Gymraeg yn rhan ffurfiol statudol o'r fframwaith cynllunio. Fel yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed y bore yma, ceir cyfeiriadau at y Gymraeg yn 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru'. Mae yna nodyn cyngor technegol 20. Fodd bynnag, nid oes dyletswydd statudol benodol ar awdurdodau cynllunio i asesu effaith datblygu ar y Gymraeg. Dyna sydd ar goll ar hyn o bryd yn y fframwaith. Felly, mae angen fframwaith statudol yn y maes cynllunio sydd yn cynnwys y Gymraeg. Yr ydym yn sicr o'r farn bod y Bil cynllunio yn cynnig cyfle unigryw i wneud hynny. Fel swyddfa'r comisiynydd, gwnaethom ni ymateb i'r Papur Gwyn ar y Bil drafft yn gynharach eleni, gan wneud cynigion penodol ar y pwynt hwnnw. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r Bil wedi cychwyn ei daith ddeddfwriaethol drwy'r Cynulliad erbyn hyn. Byddwn yn sicr yn cyflwyno tystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd ynglŷn â hynny a hefyd, os cawn ni wahoddiad, byddwn yn sicr yn hapus iawn i ymddangos o flaen y pwyllgor. Yr hyn yr ydym wedi ceisio ei wneud hyd yma ydy dangos bod y Gymraeg yn fater fframweithiol yn y maes cynllunio. Hynny yw, nad polisi yn unig mohono. Dyna sy'n bwysig. Clywsom y bore yma gan y Prif Weinidog mai Bil fframweithiol strwythurol ydy'r Bil cynllunio. Felly, byddwn yn ailadrodd ein tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor amgylchedd i bwysleisio hynny ac i bwysleisio'r cyfle i gynnwys y Gymraeg o fewn y fframwaith hwnnw.

Mr Sion: Our main focus, as an organisation, in the planning field is to get the Welsh language to be a formal statutory part of the planning framework. As we have already heard this morning, there are references to the Welsh language in 'Planning Policy Wales'. There is technical advice note 20. However, there is no specific statutory duty upon planning authorities to assess the impact of developments on the Welsh language. That is what is missing from the framework at present. Therefore, we need a statutory framework in the planning field that includes the Welsh language. We are definitely of the view that the planning Bill offers a unique opportunity to do that. As the commissioner's office, we responded to the White Paper on the draft Bill earlier this year, making specific proposals on that point. As you know, the Bill has started its legislative journey through the Assembly by now. We will certainly be presenting evidence to the Environment and Sustainability Committee on that, and, also, if we receive an invitation, we will certainly be happy to appear before the committee. What we have tried to do to date is demonstrate that the Welsh language is a framework issue in the planning field. That is, it is not just a policy. That is what is important. We heard this morning from the First Minister that the planning Bill is a structural, framework Bill. So, we will be repeating our evidence to the environment committee to emphasise that and to emphasise the opportunity to include the Welsh language within that framework.

Christine Chapman: Rhodri, before I bring you back in, I know that Gwyn had a supplementary question on that. I will then bring you in, if that is okay.

[149] **Gwyn R. Price:** After listening to the First Minister this morning, have you had clarity on TAN 20 in terms of practical guidance and the status of local development plans? Are you further forward now with your understanding?

[150] **Mr Sion:** Ydym. Cafodd nodyn cyngor technegol 20 ei gyhoeddi y llynedd. Yn sgîl hynny, mae canllawiau atodol ychwanegol wedi cael eu datblygu gan y Llywodraeth. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth yr ydym ni, fel swyddfa'r comisiynydd, a nifer o awdurdodau cynllunio wedi bod yn galw amdano. Mae'n ddyddiau cynnar ar o bryd, rwy'n meddwl, o ran y canllaw hwnnw, a bydd yn ddiddorol gweld i ba raddau y bydd awdurdodau cynllunio yn gallu gwneud defnydd o'r canllaw a pha mor ddefnyddiol ydyw iddyn nhw.

Mr Sion: Yes. Technical advice note 20 was published last year. Following that, additional supplementary guidelines have been developed by the Government. That is something that we as a commissioner's office and a number of planning authorities have been calling for. It is early days at present, I think, from the point of view of that guidance, and it will be interesting to see to what extent planning authorities will be able to make use of the guidance and how useful it will be to them.

[151] Beth mae'r TAN 20 newydd yn ei wneud yw newid y ffocws oddi ar ystyried effaith ar geisiadau unigol i ystyried effaith ar gynlluniau datblygu ar ddechrau'r broses. Yn sicr, mae'n synhwyrol bod yr asesiad yn digwydd efo cynlluniau datblygu, ond rydym yn meddwl hefyd bod angen i awdurdodau cynllunio gael yr hyblygrwydd wedyn i allu cynnal asesiadau effaith ar geisiadau unigol pan fo angen.

What the new TAN 20 does is shift the focus from considering the impact on individual applications to considering the impact on development plans at the beginning of the process. Certainly, it is sensible that the assessment should happen with the development plans, but we also believe that planning authorities should then have the flexibility to be able to undertake impact assessments on individual applications as required.

[152] Fodd bynnag, mae'n ddyddiau cynnar ar hyn o bryd. Cawn weld sut mae awdurdodau cynllunio yn gallu defnyddio'r canllaw newydd.

However, it is early days at the moment. It will be interesting to see how planning authorities will be able to use the new guidance.

[153] **Christine Chapman:** Rhodri, did you want to finish before we turn to Jocelyn?

[154] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gan eich bod wedi sôn am y dystiolaeth yr ydych eisoes wedi ei chyflwyno i'r Gweinidog, a'ch bod yn bwriadu cyflwyno tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor amgylchedd, a ydych chi'n rhydd i rannu'r dystiolaeth honno gyda ni fel pwyllgor? A fyddech chi'n fodlon hala nodyn atom ni?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Given that you have mentioned the evidence that you have already provided to the Minister, and that you do intend to provide further evidence to the environment committee, could you share that evidence with us as a committee? Would you be willing to send us a note on that?

[155] **Ms Huws:** Byddwn yn hapus iawn i wneud hynny. Anfonwn becyn o'r wybodaeth i lawr atoch.

Ms Huws: I would be very happy to do that. We will send a pack of the information to you.

[156] **Jocelyn Davies:** On this point of technical advice notes—[*Inaudible.*]—other technical advice notes, where communities think that they have some protection on appeal. The inspectorate has not given the weight to the technical advice note that communities and planning authorities had hoped for. So, do you have discussions with the inspectorate about its view on the weight that it gives to technical advice notes?

[157] **Ms Huws:** I ddechrau, rwy'n credu taw'r rheswm pam rydym yn teimlo'n gryf, fel swyddfa'r comisiynydd, ei fod yn bwysig

Ms Huws: First, I believe that the reason why we strongly feel, as the commissioner's office, that it is very important to ensure that

iawn sicrhau bod cyfeiriad at y Gymraeg yn y ddeddfwriaeth hon yw er mwyn sicrhau nad yw'r cwestiynau hyn ynglŷn â swyddogaeth nodau cyngor technegol yn codi. Petai yno yn fframweithiol o fewn y ddeddfwriaeth, ni fyddai'r amheuaeth honno yn codi o gwbl. Mae cyfle bendigedig yn y fan hon gyda'r ddeddfwriaeth hon, sydd yn ddeddfwriaeth fframweithiol, i sicrhau hynny.

there is reference to the Welsh language in this legislation is in order to ensure that these questions on the function of TANs do not arise. If it is there as a framework issue within the legislation, that doubt would not arise at all. There is a wonderful opportunity here with this legislation, which is framework legislation, to ensure that that is the case.

[158] **Jocelyn Davies:** Good luck.

[159] **Christine Chapman:** Rhodri, did you have further questions?

[160] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Diolch yn fawr iawn, Gadeirydd. Eto, clywsoch y Prif Weinidog yn ymateb i'r cwestiynau ar y gyllideb, y cyfeiriad at y cyfrifiad a'i ganlyniadau, y Gynhadledd Fawr a sefydlwyd ganddo a'r ddogfen 'Iaith fyw: iaith byw—Bwrw mlaen'. Beth yw'ch argraffiadau chi o'r modd y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymateb i'r cyfrifiad ac yn benodol, wrth gwrs, bod gostyngiad yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y Gymraeg ac ar gyfer swyddfa'r comisiynydd hefyd?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Thank you very much, Chair. Again, you heard the First Minister responding to the questions on the budget, his reference to the census and its results, the *Cynhadledd Fawr* that was established by him and the 'A living language: a language for living—Moving forward' document. What are your impressions of the manner in which the Government has responded to the census and specifically, of course, that there has been a reduction in the budget for the Welsh language and also for the office of the commissioner?

[161] **Ms Huws:** Yn gyntaf, a gaf i egluro taw'r ffordd arferol y byddwn fel comisiynydd yn derbyn gwybodaeth ffeithiol oddi wrth y Llywodraeth ynglŷn â'i pherfformiad yw trwy ei hadroddiad monitro blynyddol, ar sail ei chynllun iaith? Yn anffodus, nid ydym wedi derbyn ei hadroddiad monitro eleni, felly mae'n anodd iawn gweld ffeithiau cadarn o'n blaenau ynglŷn â'i pherfformiad. Felly, a gaf i ddweud yn y lle cyntaf ein bod yn dal i ddisgwyl ei hadroddiad monitro blynyddol?

Ms Huws: First, may I just explain that the usual way in which I as commissioner would receive factual evidence from the Government on its performance would be through its annual monitoring report, on the basis of its language scheme? Unfortunately, we have not received its monitoring report this year, therefore it is very difficult to actually view those hard facts in terms of performance. So, may I say in the first place that we are still awaiting its monitoring report?

[162] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ymddiheuriadau am dorri ar draws, ond a ydych chi'n awgrymu y byddech chi wedi disgwyl derbyn y cynllun monitro hwnnw erbyn hyn?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Apologies for interrupting, but are you suggesting that you would have expected to have received this monitoring report by now?

[163] **Ms Huws:** Y cyfnod derbyn yw'r haf, fel arfer. Felly, ar sail hynny, nid oes gennyf unrhyw beth penodol iawn ymlaen. Rwy'n ymwybodol iawn o'r gwahanol ymgyrchoedd, y gwahanol ddatblygiadau a'r gwahanol adolygiadau sydd wedi bod ynglŷn â'r Gymraeg yn ystod y blynyddoedd

Ms Huws: The period for receiving it is the summer, usually. So, on that basis, I have very little to say. I am very aware of the various campaigns, developments and reviews that have taken place involving the Welsh language over the past few years. For me, the important part of positive

diwethaf. I mi, hanfod datblygiadau cadarnhaol yw bod strategaeth glir i dynnu'r holl elfennau at ei gilydd a bod y strategaeth honno'n seiliedig ar ddata penodol.

developments is that there should be a clear strategy to draw all of those strands together and that that strategy should be based on specific data.

[164] Rydych wedi sôn am ddata'r cyfrifiad, ac mae gennym ynddynt fan cychwyn. Wedyn, wrth weithredu strategaeth, byddech yn disgwyl deall traweffaith ymgyrchoedd, datblygiadau ac adolygiadau ar y data hynny, a bod tystiolaeth gadarn ynglŷn â thraweffaith. Rwy'n credu ei bod yn ddyddiau cynnar i allu gweld hynny.

You have mentioned the census data, and in them we have a starting point. Then, in implementing a strategy, you would expect to understand the impact of campaigns, developments and reviews on those data, and that there is hard evidence on impact. I think that it is early days to see that.

[165] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gofynnodd Jocelyn Davies gyfres o gwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog ynglŷn â'r toriad mewn gwariant ar Gymraeg i oedolion a'r modd y gellir mesur effaith hynny ac a oes dirywiad yn y niferoedd sy'n manteisio ar y cyfleoedd hynny. A ydyw penderfyniad y Prif Weinidog i ganolbwyntio ar geisio hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg ymhlith ieuenctid ac, er mwyn ariannu hynny, torri'r gwariant ar Gymraeg i oedolion yn un yr ydych yn poeni amdano?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Jocelyn Davies asked a series of questions to the First Minister on the reduction in expenditure on Welsh for adults and the way in which that impact could be measured and whether there is a decline in the numbers taking advantage of those opportunities. Is the First Minister's decision to focus on trying to promote the Welsh language among young people and, in order to fund that, cutting expenditure on Welsh for adults something that you are concerned about?

[166] **Ms Huws:** Yn naturiol, mae unrhyw waith gyda phobl ifanc yn waith y byddwn i'n ei gefnogi, ond dof yn ôl at yr ateb blaenorol. Rwy'n credu mai'r hyn sy'n bwysig wrth wneud unrhyw benderfyniadau ynglŷn â chyllideb a chyfeiriad strategol yw cadernid y dystiolaeth a chadernid y ddealltwriaeth o'r dystiolaeth wrth wneud penderfyniadau. Mae hynny, rwy'n credu, yn eithriadol o bwysig mewn maes fel y Gymraeg. Nid yw iaith byth yn faes rhwydd i fesur nac ystyried traweffaith, ond mae'n eithriadol o bwysig i gael tystiolaeth gadarn a dealltwriaeth gref o'r dystiolaeth honno o'r dechrau.

Ms Huws: Naturally, any work with young people is work that I would support, but I will return to my previous response. I think that what is important in making any decisions on budget and strategic direction is the robustness of the evidence and the robustness of the understanding of that evidence in making decisions. I think that that is exceptionally important in an area such as the Welsh language. Language is never an easy area to measure or to consider impact, but it is exceptionally important that we have hard evidence and a strong understanding of that evidence from the outset.

[167] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A ydych chi wedi cael unrhyw dystiolaeth gan bobl sy'n ymwneud â Chymraeg i oedolion y gallai'r penderfyniad hwn fod yn andwyol i'r gwaith y maen nhw'n ei gyflawni ledled Cymru?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Have you received any evidence from people involved in teaching Welsh to adults that this decision could be detrimental to the work that they carry out throughout Wales?

[168] **Ms Huws:** Rwy'n ymwybodol o'r trafodaethau sydd yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd. Yn amlwg, mae yna drafodaethau, rydym ni'n eu clywed nhw, ynglŷn â'r consýrn. Y prif beth y dof i'n ôl ato eto yw lleoliad

Ms Huws: I am aware of the discussions that are ongoing. Clearly, there are discussions, we hear them, regarding concerns. The main thing that I will return to again is the location of such decisions within a national strategy

penderfyniadau o'r math hwnnw mewn strategaeth genedlaethol ynglŷn â dyfodol y Gymraeg. Dyna'r elfen bwysig, sef bod pobl yn deall pam fo toriadau yn cael eu gwneud neu pam fo newidiadau yn cael eu gwneud mewn cyllideb ar sail tystiolaeth.

about the future of the Welsh language. That is the important element, so that people understand why there are cuts or why changes are made to budgets on the basis of evidence.

[169] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn amlwg, mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cael cyngor gan swyddfa'r comisiynydd, ac roedd e'n sôn am fudiadau fel Dyfodol i'r Iaith ac y mae wedi bod yn cael trafodaethau gyda Chymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg hefyd. A ydych chi'n credu bod 'Bwrw Mlaen' yn adlewyrchu'r dystiolaeth y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi ei chael gan y grwpiau hyn a'r grwpiau gorchwyl sydd yn bodoli?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Evidently, the First Minister receives advice from the commissioner's office, and he mentioned organisations such as Dyfodol i'r Iaith and he has had discussions with Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg too. Do you believe that 'Moving Forward' reflects the evidence that the First Minister has received from these groups and the task groups that exist?

[170] **Ms Huws:** Heb osgoi'r cwestiwn, rwy'n credu mai cwestiwn i'r Prif Weinidog fyddai hwnnw ynglŷn â sut y mae wedi defnyddio'r dystiolaeth y mae wedi ei chasglu ar hyd y ffordd a'i bwydo i mewn i 'Bwrw Mlaen'.

Ms Huws: Without wishing to evade your question, I think that that would be a question for the First Minister in terms of how he has used the evidence he has gathered along the way and fed that into 'Moving Forward'.

[171] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Rwy'n derbyn ein bod ni ar faes braidd yn sensitif, ond a fyddai swyddfa'r comisiynydd yn ystyried bod blaenoriaethau eraill sydd heb eu cynnwys yn 'Bwrw Mlaen' neu sydd heb gael digon o flaenoriaeth ynddi?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I accept that we are on rather sensitive ground, but would the commissioner's office consider that there are alternative priorities that have not been included in 'Moving Forward' or that have not been given sufficient priority within it?

[172] **Ms Huws:** Mae 'Bwrw Mlaen' yn gam sy'n dilyn 'Iaith fyw: iaith byw'. Nid yw'n ddogfen hirfaith ac felly rwy'n siŵr bod meysydd eraill y gallech chi adnabod. Cam ydyw ar hyd y ffordd.

Ms Huws: 'Moving Forward' is a development of 'A living language: a language for living'. It is not a lengthy document, so I am sure that there are other areas that you could identify. It is a step along the way.

[173] **Christine Chapman:** Alun, do you have a question?

[174] **Alun Davies:** Rwy'n *tempted* i barhau gyda chwestiynau Rhodri, achos—

Alun Davies: I am tempted to continue with Rhodri's line of questioning, because—

[175] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** [*Anhyglyw.*]

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: [*Inaudible.*]

[176] **Alun Davies:** Na, nid wyf yn credu ei fod wedi llwyddo. Roedd y Prif Weinidog yn eithaf clir pan oedd yn ateb ein cwestiynau ni y bore yma fod un cyllideb ar gyfer y Gymraeg, ac rydym ni'n deall a gweld hynny, ond bod gwaith a chyllidebau eraill mewn gwahanol bortffolios ac adrannau yn y Llywodraeth yn y fan hon ac mewn cyrff cyhoeddus a llywodraeth leol yn y fan draw

Alun Davies: No, I do not think that he succeeded. The First Minister was quite clear when he was answering our questions this morning that there is one budget for the Welsh language, and we understand and see that, but that other work is happening and that there are other budgets in different portfolios and departments in the Government here, and in public bodies and

lle mae rôl bwysig i'r Gymraeg a bod yn rhaid i'r Gymraeg fod yn rhan hanfodol o wahanol benderfyniadau gan y Llywodraeth ac eraill. A ydych chi'n gweld tystiolaeth fod hynny yn digwydd?

local government elsewhere where there is an important role for the Welsh language, and that the Welsh language must be an essential part of various decisions taken by the Government and others. Do you see evidence that that is happening?

11:30

[177] **Ms Huws:** Un consýrn yr wyf wedi ei fynegi yn yr adroddiad blynyddol cyntaf yw nad oedd cydgysylltu rhwng meysydd polisi—bod tueddiad i feysydd polisi o fewn i'r Llywodraeth, o ran y Gymraeg, i fod yn feysydd seilo a bod y Gymraeg yn eistedd mewn man lle'r oedd 'Cymraeg' ar flaen y bocs polisi. Rwy'n croesawu datganiad y Prif Weinidog fod ymdrech yn awr i edrych ar effaith penderfyniadau cyllidebol a pholisi ar draws. Maen nhw'n ddyddiau cynnar iawn. Nid wyf yn credu ein bod ni eto i weld y dystiolaeth honno yn gadarn yn dod trwyddo fod y gweu hwnnw yn digwydd yn gynhwysfawr. Mae penderfyniadau yn cael eu gwneud ym maes yr economi, rwy'n siŵr, a chynllunio, lle y mae effaith ar y Gymraeg a lle y mae cost neu fudd i'r Gymraeg, ond nid yw hynny'n cael ei weu i mewn. Felly, pe bawn yn rhoi cyngor i Lywodraeth Cymru, byddwn yn dweud bod angen parhau a phrif-ffrydio'r Gymraeg i'r meysydd polisi i gyd. Rydym yn dechrau gweld hynny yn digwydd yn y maes iechyd, ond megis dechrau ydym o ran gweu drwyddi draw. Nid yw'n digwydd yn gynhwysfawr ar hyn o bryd.

Ms Huws: One concern that I have expressed in the first annual report is that there was no co-ordination between policy areas. There was a tendency towards a silo mentality in terms of the Welsh language within the Government, and for the Welsh language to sit in a policy box labelled *Cymraeg*—Welsh. I welcome the statement made by the First Minister, that there is now an effort to look at the impact of budgetary and policy decisions across the board. We are in the very early stages. We are yet to see that evidence coming through firmly that that dovetailing is happening in a comprehensive manner. There are decisions taken in relation to the economy and planning, where there is an impact on the Welsh language and where there is a cost or a benefit to the Welsh language, but that is not necessarily being included or woven into the fabric of things. So, if I were to advise the Welsh Government, I would say that it needs to continue and to mainstream the Welsh langugae into all policy areas. We are starting to see that happening in health, but it is only just staring where there is proper dovetailing. That is not happening across the board at present.

[178] **Alun Davies:** Ble mae'r gwendidau?

Alun Davies: Where are there weaknesses?

[179] **Ms Huws:** Mae heriau mawr ym maes yr economi a gwaith.

Ms Huws: The greatest challenges are in the area of the economy and jobs.

[180] **Alun Davies:** Pam felly? Sut y byddech yn disgrifio'r heriau neu'r gwendidau yr ydych wedi eu codi?

Alun Davies: Why, therefore? How would you describe those challenges or weaknesses that you have referred to?

[181] **Ms Huws:** Un o'r hen sloganau a ddefnyddiwyd o ran y Gymraeg oedd 'Tai a gwaith i gadw'r iaith', a chredaf fod hynny yn dal i fod yn bwysig. Mae sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd o ran cynllunio polisi yn eithriadol o bwysig. Mae'r cyswllt rhwng cynllunio sgiliau, sgiliau'r gweithlu, a'r economi hefyd yn bwysig. Os ydym yn mynd i ddatblygu swyddi ar draws Cymru, mae'n

Ms Huws: One of the old slogans used with regard to Welsh was 'Homes and jobs to safeguard the language', and I believe that that is still important. Ensuring that that happens in terms of policy development is extremely important. The link between planning skills, workforce skills and the economy are also important. If we are to develop jobs across Wales, we have to ensure

rhaid inni sicrhau bod y sgiliau ar gael i sicrhau bod y swyddi hynny yn cael eu llenwi. Mae hynny'n wir mewn meysydd fel iechyd, ac y mae yn sicr yn wir mewn meysydd fel twristiaeth a chynllunio. Mae'n wir am y meysydd i gyd. Yr hyn y mae arnom ei angen—ac mae Cymru yn wlad fach—yw polisi gweladwy a strategaeth weladwy gynhwysfawr o ran y meysydd hyn i gyd—yr economi, sgiliau, iechyd ac addysg i gyd gyda'i gilydd.

that the skills are in place to ensure that those jobs can be filled. That is true in areas such as health, and it is certanly true in areas such as tourism and planning. It is true across the board. What we need to have—and Wales is a small nation—is a policy that is visible and a strategy that is comprehensive in that it relates to all of these areas—the economy, skills, health and education all together.

[182] **Alun Davies:** Rydych wedi rhoi'r economi fel enghraifft o faes polisi ac yna trafodoch chi sgiliau. A oes her yn dy *area* di o ran unrhyw le arall ym maes polisi o ran yr economi?

Alun Davies: You have given the economy as an example of a policy field and then you discussed skills. Is there a challenge anywhere else, in your view, in the field of economic policy?

[183] **Ms Huws:** Buaswn yn dweud bod pob un ohonynt yn heriol; y sialens yw i'w gweu nhw i gyd at ei gilydd yn hytrach na'u gweld nhw i gyd yn—

Ms Huws: I would say that every one of them is challenging; the challenge is to bring all of them together rather than seeing them all—

[184] **Alun Davies:** Ond chi sydd wedi dewis maes yr economi fel enghraifft.

Alun Davies: However, you selected the field of the economy as an example.

[185] **Christine Chapman:** Alun, let the commissioner finish.

[186] **Ms Huws:** Dewisais faes yr economi fel un, ond gallwn hefyd enwi cynllunio. Mae'r gwaith a wnaethom o ran yr ymholiad iechyd yn dangos y cyfleoedd a'r heriau sydd yn y meysydd hynny o ran cynllunio o ran y Gymraeg. Nid yw hynny yn unig o ran darpariaeth ond hefyd ynglŷn â hyfforddi gweithlu'r dyfodol, a sicrhau bod y gweithlu hwnnw yn y lleoedd iawn ar yr adegau iawn. O wneud hynny, mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau bod cartrefi i'r gweithlu hwnnw yn y lleoedd iawn ar yr adeg iawn. Felly, dewisais yr economi fel un esiampl, ond gallwn ddadlau bod angen gweu'r meysydd sydd o gyfrifoldeb y Llywodraeth hon i gyd at ei gilydd o ran y Gymraeg. Dyna yw'r her fwyaf: i weld y cysylltiadau a gwneud hynny'n weladwy ac, o weld y cysylltiadau, ymateb iddynt wedyn.

Ms Huws: I referred to the economy, but I could also talk about planning. The work that we did in terms of our inquiry into healthcare demonstrated the opportunities that exist in that area in terms of planning for the Welsh language. That is not only in terms of provision but it also relates to training the workforce of the future and ensuring that that workforce is in the right place at the right time. In doing that, we must ensure that there are homes available for that workforce in the right places at the right time. So, I chose the economy as one example, but I could argue that we need to bring all of these areas for which the Welsh Government is responsible together in terms of the Welsh language. That is the greatest challenge: to identify those links and to make that visible and, in identifyuing the links, respond to them.

[187] **Alun Davies:** Iawn. Beth am feysydd eraill yn y sector gyhoeddus yng Nghymru? Rydym wedi sôn am Lywodraeth Cymru, ond beth am lywodraeth leol a chyrff cyhoeddus gwahanol? A ydych yn gweld yr uchelgeisiau yr ydych wedi eu rhannu gyda ni yn cael eu gwireddu yn y sector llywodraeth leol a gyda

Alun Davies: Okay. What about other areas in the public sector in Wales? We have talked about the Welsh Government, but what about local government and other public bodies? Do you see the ambitions that you have shared with us being realised in the local government sector and among other bodies?

chyrff eraill?

[188] **Ms Huws:** Mae'r sector llywodraeth leol yn un diddorol, oherwydd dyna fydd un o'r criwiau, neu sectorau, cyntaf a fydd yn ymateb i'r safonau y flwyddyn nesaf, pan fydd y safonau yn cael eu gosod ym mis Mawrth a dros yr haf. Mae camau, yn sicr, wedi eu cymryd yn ystod y degawdau diwethaf o ran llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru o ran ymateb i ddeddfwriaeth 1993 a chynlluniau iaith. Yn sicr, o'n rhan ni, byddwn yn disgwyl ac yn gobeithio gweld wrth weithredu safonau bod camu ymlaen ar yr hyn sydd wedi cael ei gyflawni gan gynlluniau iaith. Mae llywodraeth leol yn aruthrol o bwysig. Fel y dywedais, bydd yn mynd drwy'r set gyntaf o safonau, ond mae'n bwysig i beidio ag anghofio'r byrddau iechyd a'r cyrff addysg a fydd yn dod gyda'r ail gylch, a'r cyfraniad aruthrol o bwysig y byddant yn ei wneud wrth sicrhau nid yn unig gwell gwasanaeth ond gwell ansawdd penderfyniadau polisi, gwell defnydd o'r Gymraeg o fewn y gweithle, a gwell hybu defnydd o'r Gymraeg yn gyffredinol.

Ms Huws: The local government sector is interesting, because that is one of the first cohorts, or sectors, that will have to respond to the standards next year, when the standards are imposed next March and over the summer months. Steps have certainly been taken over past decades in terms of local government in Wales in responding to the 1993 legislation and language schemes. Certainly, from our point of view, we would expect and hope to see in implementing standards that we can develop what has been achieved under the language schemes. Local authorities are extremely important. As I said, they will be involved with the first set of standards, but let us not forget the health boards and the education bodies that will be included in the second round, and the hugely important contribution that they will make in ensuring not only improved services, but improved policy decisions, better use of the Welsh language within the workplace and better promotion of the use of the Welsh language more generally.

[189] **Christine Chapman:** There are questions from Gwenda and Mike. We are coming up to halfway, so I want to make sure that all Members have the opportunity to ask questions. Gwenda is first.

[190] **Gwenda Thomas:** Yn dilyn y pwyntiau blaenorol a wnaeth Alun, ac wrth edrych yn ôl ar beth y dywedoch am hawliau, rydym yn gwybod i Ddeddf Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a Llesiant (Cymru) 2014 gael ei seilio ar hawliau. Un o'r pethau, yn fy marn i, a ddaeth i'r brig yn ystod y broses sgriwtineiddio oedd angen iaith. Pa mor bwysig yn eich barn chi yw bod y Llywodraeth yn mabwysiadu'r egwyddor o angen iaith yn hytrach na dewis iaith yn unig ar draws yr holl ddeddfwriaethu?

Gwenda Thomas: Following the previous points made by Alun, and in looking back at what you said about rights, we know that Social Services and Well-being (Wales) Act 2014 was based on rights. One of the things that came to the fore, in my opinion, during the scrutiny process was language need. How important in your opinion is it for the Government to adopt the principle of language need rather than the language of choice across the whole legislative range?

[191] **Ms Huws:** Diolch am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Fel yr ydych yn gwybod, mae'r maes iechyd wedi bod yn agos iawn at fy nghalon fel comisiynydd, ac mae'r gwaith a gyflawnwyd yn barod o ran 'Mwy na Geiriau' wedi gosod sail i hynny. Roedd y maes iechyd yn faes ymchwil penodol i ni, fel yr ydych yn gwybod. Penderfynom yn ystod blwyddyn gyntaf gweithredu fel comisiynydd bod angen edrych ar y maes gofal sylfaenol, a hynny oherwydd bod pobl

Ms Huws: Thank you for that question. As you know, the health sector has been very close to my heart as a commissioner, and the work that we have already achieved in terms of 'More than Just Words' has been a foundation for that. The health sector was a specific area for inquiry for us, as you will know. We decided during our first year of operation as a commissioner that we needed to look at the area of primary care, and that was because people told us how important

yn dweud wrthym pa mor bwysig oedd y maes gofal sylfaenol iddynt. O gynnal yr ymholiad iechyd hwnnw a gwneud darn o waith sylweddol, mae darn o waith ymchwil mawr yn y fan honno sydd yn rhoi *marker* i ni, sydd yn rhoi man cychwyn i ni wrth edrych ar anghenion y dyfodol.

that primary care sector was to them. In carrying out that health inquiry and doing a significant piece of work, there is a major piece of research work there which puts down a marker for us, which gives us a starting point in looking at needs for the future.

[192] Un o'r pethau a ddaeth allan yn gryf oedd bod cyfathrebu yn greiddiol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, a bod y Gymraeg yn angen clinigol yn aml iawn i unigolion. Nid mater o ffasiwn ydyw neu ryw awydd—mae'n angen clinigol. I gymryd hynny ymhellach, ni ddylai'r gwasanaeth iechyd fod yn disgwyl i'r claf fynegi hynny, ond dylai fod yn gwneud cynnig rhagweithiol a chynnig y cyfle i gyfathrebu yn y Gymraeg ar ddechrau yr ymwneud. Felly, mae angen iaith yn eithriadol o bwysig, ond byddwn i yn ei gymryd un cam ymhellach a dweud, er mwyn sicrhau bod hynny yn cael ei wireddu, bod angen i wasanaethau iechyd a gofal Cymru weithio ar sail cynnig rhagweithiol, ac nid disgwyl i'r claf ofyn.

One of the things that emerged strongly was that communication is at the heart of the health service, and that the Welsh language is very often a clinical need for individuals. It is not a matter of fashion or some whim—it is a clinical need. To take that further, the health service should not expect the patient to express that, but to make an active offer and to provide opportunities for communication through the medium of Welsh at the start of the interaction. Therefore, language need is very important, but I would take it a step further and say that in order to ensure that that is achieved, health services and care services in Wales need to work on the basis of an active offer, not awaiting for a request from the patient.

[193] **Mike Hedges:** Mae'n flin gennyf i; byddaf yn gofyn yn Saesneg.

Mike Hedges: I am sorry; I will ask in English.

[194] My experience is that mainstreaming often means that you lose accountability and that you can hide cuts in there and no-one knows where they are happening. From my personal experience only in Swansea it is not the mainstream—it is the actual things like *Twrw Tawe* providing a Welsh-medium use facility for children and young adults between the age of 12 and 25, where they have an option to use the medium of Welsh in a social environment. It is things like *Wilia*, our local *papur bro*, which is read quite extensively by Welsh-speaking people. It is things like that, which are not anything to do with the mainstream, but they are specific actions that have an effect. Do you recognise that and do you have any concerns?

[195] **Ms Huws:** Diolch yn fawr. Nid dewis yw hyn; nid yw yn fater o'r naill neu'r llall. Rwy'n credu ei fod yn eithriadol o bwysig ein bod yn prif-ffrydio, ond hefyd yn edrych ar beth sy'n cael effaith uniongyrchol ar fywydau pobl. Os edrychwch ar yr adroddiad blynyddol, un o'r darnau o waith rwy'n falch iawn ohono yw'r gwaith yr ydym yn ei wneud gyda'r trydydd sector a'r sector busnes, ond y trydydd sector yn benodol iawn, i sicrhau bod darpariaeth gymunedol a darpariaeth chwaraeaon, a bod y cyrff sydd yn darparu'r math hwnnw o wasanaeth ar lawr gwlad yn wirfoddol yn deall, yn gyntaf, sut mae modd gweithio'n ddwyieithog, ac yn ail, yn gwneud hynny. Mae darn o waith a

Ms Huws: Thank you very much. This is not a choice of one or the other. I think that it is extremely important that we do mainstream, but that we also look at what has a direct impact on people's lives. If you look at the annual report, one of the pieces of work that I am extremely proud of is the work that we are doing with the third sector and the business sector, but specifically with the third sector, to ensure community provision and the provision of sport, and that organisations that provide those kinds of services at grassroots level on a voluntary basis first of all understand how it is possible to work bilingually, and secondly, actually do so. There is a piece of work that we did during

wnaethom yn ystod y flwyddyn gyda Chwaraeon Cymru, lle buom yn gweithio gyda'r cymdeithasau chwaraeon a'r cymdeithasau mabolgampau. Buom yn gweithio gyda chymdeithasau a oedd yn ymwneud â thenis bwrdd, hwylio, hoci a gymnasteg. Y cwestiwn yr oeddent yn ei ofyn i ni oedd: 'Sut ydym yn gwneud hyn?'—nid 'Pam?' ond 'Sut allwn ni ddatblygu gwasanaeth sydd yn ddwyieithog?' Yr hyn yr ydym wedi bod yn ei wneud felly yw cynnig cyngor penodol iawn iddynt.

the year with Sport Wales, where we worked with sports associations and athletics associations. We worked with associations involved with table tennis, sailing, hockey and gymnastics. The question that they asked us was 'How do we do this?'—not 'Why?' but 'How can we develop a service that is bilingual?' What we have been doing therefore is to provide very specific advice to them.

[196] Rydym wedi cynhyrchu dogfen i'r trydydd sector yn edrych ar sut i ddenu gwirfoddolwyr, sut i'w hyfforddi, a sut i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg yn y maes gwirfoddoli. Felly, rydym yn sicrhau bod y cyrff trydydd sector pwysig hyn yn cael yr arfau i ddatblygu gwasanaethau dwyieithog ac i wneud beth sydd wedi digwydd yn Abertawe ar lawr gwlad. Rwyf wedi cael fy synnu gan yr ymateb. Mae criw o swyddogion allan y bore yma o swyddfa'r comisiynydd yn gweithio gydag 20 o sefydliadau gwasanaethau gwirfoddol plant yng Nghymru yn cynnig y math hwn o hyfforddiant—canllawiau a chyngor ar lawr gwlad ar sut i wneud yn ogystal â pham y dylid ei wneud.

We have produced a document for the third sector looking at how to attract volunteers, how to train them, and how to use the Welsh language in voluntary activity. Therefore, we are ensuring that these very important third sector organisations have the tools to develop bilingual services and to do elsewhere what has already happened in Swansea. I have been shocked by the response. There is a group of officials out today from the commissioner's office working with 20 voluntary children's services organisations in Wales, providing this sort of training—guidance and advice at a grass-roots level as to how you actually do this, as well as why it should be done.

[197] **Peter Black:** Rhodri Glyn Thomas has already asked one of my questions, but in terms of the 8% reduction in funding for your office, what impact is it actually having on the work of the commission?

[198] **Ms Huws:** Rydym newydd gael gwybod ein bod yn cael ail doriad yn ein cyllideb. Cawsom doriad o 10% y llynedd, ac yn y flwyddyn sydd o'n blaenau, rydym yn cael toriad o 8%. Mae'n cael effaith sylweddol ar gorff bach a newydd. Erbyn diwedd y bedwaredd flwyddyn o weithredu byddwn wedi cael toriad o 24.8% mewn termau real ar ein cyllideb. Mae hynny'n golygu, yn anffodus, mai'r gwaith llai statudol sy'n cael ei dorri. Mae'r math o waith yr wyf newydd ei ddisgrifio gyda'r trydydd sector yn cael ei grebachu. Rydym yn gorfod gweithredu'n swyddogaethau cyfreithiol statudol o dan y Mesur ac o dan Ddeddf 1993, ond y darnau eraill o waith, y darnau arloesol, cyffrous o waith, sydd yn dioddef, yn anffodus, ac mae hynny'n peri tristwch.

Ms Huws: We have just been informed that we are to undergo a second cut in our budget. There was a cut of 10% last year, and in the next year, we will face a cut of 8%. It has a significant impact on a small, relatively new, organisation. By the end of the fourth year of existence, we will have seen a cut of 24.8% in real terms on our budget. That means, unfortunately, that the work that is less statutory in nature is going to be cut. The kind of work that I have just described with the third sector will see some shrinkage. We have to carry out our statutory functions under the Measure and under the 1993 Act, but it is those other pieces of work, the innovative, exciting pieces of work, that are unfortunately going to suffer, and that is a cause of sadness.

[199] Rhaid imi ddweud fy mod yn deall yn iawn bod toriadau cyllidebol ym mhobman ar draws Cymru. Mae'r toriad hwn yn un sylweddol ar ôl ychydig iawn o flynyddoedd o weithredu. Hefyd, mae'n gofyn cwestiwn sylweddol ynglŷn â ffynhonnell ein cyllideb. Pan fyddwn yn gorff sy'n rheoleiddio'r Llywodraeth, ac ar yr un pryd yn cael ein hariannu'n uniongyrchol gan y Llywodraeth, a ydyw hynny'n gyfansoddiadol dderbyniol?

I have to say that I understand that there are cuts in all areas across Wales. However, this cut is a significant one having only been in existence for just a few years. It also asks a major question about the source of our budget. When we are a body that regulates the Government but are also simultaneously directly funded by the Government, is that constitutionally sound?

[200] **Peter Black:** I will come back to that in a second. In terms of the process, how much notice were you given of those cuts, and did you have time to do any preparation work before you heard of them?

[201] **Ms Huws:** Y llynedd, tynnais sylw at y ffaith bod y rhybudd yn eithriadol o fyr, os bu cyfnod rhybudd o gwbl. Rydym wedi cael gwybod yn gynharach eleni ac rydym, o ganlyniad, wedi cael ychydig mwy o amser i edrych ar y gyllideb a gwneud y toriadau angenrheidiol. Felly, o ran y broses, mae wedi bod yn haws eleni. Nid yw effaith y toriad yn haws o gwbl.

Ms Huws: Last year, I drew attention to the fact that the warning period was exceptionally brief, if there was any warning period at all. We were informed earlier this year and, as a result, have had a little more time to look at our budget and make the necessary cuts. So, in terms of process, it has been easier this year. The impact of the cuts is no easier at all.

[202] **Peter Black:** On the independence issue, the First Minister has said that there are areas where there is potential for duplication between the Government and the commissioner's role and that the resource has potential to identify ways of joint and different working. What is your response to that? Does that impinge on your independence as an organisation?

[203] **Ms Huws:** Mae swyddogaethau'r comisiynydd yn cael eu gosod allan yn glir ym Mesur y Gymraeg (Cymru) 2011. Mae'n glir iawn o ran y Mesur beth yw'r disgwyliadau ohonom. Rydym yn gorff sydd ddim yn Llywodraeth. Rydym yn gorff gwahanol iawn i'r Llywodraeth. Mae yna feysydd lle mae angen cyd-ddealltwriaeth. Byddwn yn dweud bod y gwaith gyda'r trydydd sector yn un lle byddai dyblygu yn ddibwrpas. Felly, rydym wedi datblygu ffordd o weithio drwy gynnig cyngor a hyfforddiant sydd yn wahanol iawn i'r ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth yn gweithio gyda'r sector hwnnw. Byddwn yn dweud ein bod wedi cynllunio i sicrhau nad oes dyblygu. Gallwn weithio ochr yn ochr; mae cyd-ddealltwriaeth o'r hyn y mae'n ei gyflawni a'r hyn yr ydym ni'n ei gyflawni. Mae'r swyddogaethau'n wahanol iawn.

Ms Huws: The functions of the commissioner are set out clearly in the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011. It is very clear in the Measure what the expectations of us are. We are an organisation outwith Government. We are very different to Government. There are areas where there needs to be a mutual understanding. I would have thought that the work with the third sector is an area where duplication would be entirely pointless. So, we have developed a means of providing training and advice that is very different to the way in which the Government works with that sector. I would say that we have planned to ensure that there is no duplication. We can work along with Government; there is a mutual understanding between what it achieves and what we achieve. The functions are very different.

[204] **Christine Chapman:** Mark, did you have some questions?

[205] **Mark Isherwood:** Yes, thank you. Good morning; bore da. Could you respond to concerns that the process of introducing the first set of Welsh language standards has been 'blighted by confusion and difficulties'? What lessons do you feel can be learned for future sets of standards, noting the requirements in the 2011 Measure to continue with the same process?

11:45

[206] **Ms Huws:** A gaf i ddechrau drwy gydnabod bod gweithredu unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth newydd yn gallu arwain at gwestiynau a diffyg dealltwriaeth, yn arbennig pan ydych yn symud o un gyfundrefn i'r llall? Mae'n rhaid inni gofio yn y fan hon ein bod yn symud o gyfundrefn a oedd pobl yn ei deall, o gynlluniau iaith o dan ddeddfwriaeth 1993, i set newydd o ffyrdd o weithredu safonau Mesur y Gymraeg. Felly, a gawn ni dderbyn hynny fel cyd-destun yn y lle cyntaf?

Ms Huws: May I start by recognising that implementing any new legislation can lead to questions and a lack of understanding, particularly when you move from one regime to another? We must bear in mind here that we are moving from a system that people understood of language schemes under the 1993 Act to an entirely new modus operandi in terms of implementing the Welsh language Measure's standards. So, can we accept that as the context, first of all?

[207] Mae yna broblemau a heriau wedi codi wrth weithredu'r cylch cyntaf, a hynny'n deillio o'r amseru, rôl y Llywodraeth a rôl y comisiynydd, a'r ffaith bod y safonau yn cael eu cyhoeddi ar yr un adeg gan y Llywodraeth ag oeddem ni'n cynnal yr ymchwiliadau safonau cyntaf. Rydym wedi cydnabod hynny, ac roedd hynny, i ryw raddau, yn deillio o'r ffaith mai dyma'r cylch cyntaf o weithredu'r Mesur. Wrth i ni gynnig cyngor i Weinidogion Cymru ar ddiwedd y cyfnod ymchwiliadau safonau cyntaf, gofynnom iddynt ymgynghori ar y safonau eu hunain gan ddweud mai dyna oedd eu rôl a'u cyfrifoldeb nhw a'n bod ni'n eu hannog i wneud. Rwy'n falch iawn o ddweud eu bod wedi derbyn y cyngor hwnnw ac y byddant yn cychwyn ar ymgynghoriad ar y safonau ym mis Tachwedd.

There are problems and challenges that have arisen in implementing the first round of standards, and they have emerged from the timing, the role of Government and the role of the commissioner, and the fact that the standards were published by the Government while we were carrying out the first standards investigations. We have acknowledged that, and that, to a certain extent, emerged from the fact that this was the first round of implementing the Measure. In advising Welsh Ministers at the end of the first standards investigation period, we asked them to consult on the standards themselves, stating that that was their role and responsibility and that we encouraged them to do so. I am very pleased to say that they accepted that advice and that they will commence a consultation on the standards in November.

[208] Rwy'n reit ffyddiog, wrth i ni symud i'r ail gylch, a fydd yn tynnu i mewn byrddau iechyd, colegau addysg bellach—sefydliadau mawr cyhoeddus Cymru—na fydd y dryswch hwnnw'n digwydd yn yr un ffordd. Rydym yn camu ymlaen. Rydym wedi mynd drwy'r cam cyntaf, gan gydnabod lle mae'r problemau wedi codi o ran diffyg dealltwriaeth neu ddiffyg eglurder, ac rydym yn cynllunio ochr yn ochr â'r Llywodraeth i sicrhau nad yw hynny'n digwydd gyda'r ail gylch. Rwy'n credu ein bod yn reit ffyddiog—rwy'n edrych ar Dyfan a fydd yn

I am quite confident, as we move to the second round, which will bring in health boards, further education colleges—major public institutions in Wales—that that confusion will not be caused in the same way. We are moving forward. We have gone through the first stage, identifying where the problems arose in terms of a lack of clarity or a lack of understanding, and we are planning, along with the Government, to ensure that that does not happen with the second round. I think that we are quite confident—I am looking at Dyfan who will be responsible, as

gyfrifol, fel cyfarwyddwr, am y cylch hwnnw—na fydd y diffyg eglurder hwnnw yn deillio o'n gweithredu ni o gwbl.

director, for that second round—that that lack of clarity will not arise from our actions at all.

[209] **Mark Isherwood:** I would like you to confirm, therefore, that you do not feel that there is a need and scope to amend the 2011 Measure, given the lessons learned, or do you?

[210] **Ms Huws:** Ar hyn o bryd, yn eistedd yn y fan hon ym mis Hydref 2014, mae'n rhy gynnar i ddweud hynny. Rwy'n siŵr y daw adeg, fel gydag unrhyw ddarn o ddeddfwriaeth, lle bydd y comisiynydd yn dweud, 'Mae'n bryd i fynd yn ôl ac edrych ar hwn eto a sicrhau ei fod yn gyfredol.' Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhy gynnar i wneud y fath ddatganiadau ar hyn o bryd.

Ms Huws: At the moment, sitting here in October 2014, it is too early to say that. I am sure that there will come a time, as is the case with any piece of legislation, when the commissioner will say, 'We need to return to this and ensure that it is contemporary.' However, it is too early to make those sorts of statements now.

[211] **Mark Isherwood:** Okay. You have expressed concerns about the timetable for introducing the second and third rounds of standards. You may have heard the First Minister earlier stating his intention to introduce this to the Senedd before the end of 2015. Does that reassure you or do you still have concerns?

[212] **Ms Huws:** Rydym yn gwybod yn awr yn gywir beth yw dyddiadau'r cylch cyntaf—y 26 cyntaf. Rydym yn gwybod y bydd y rheoliadau hynny yn cael eu cyflwyno, a'r gobaith yw y byddant wedi mynd drwy'r prosesau statudol i gyd erbyn diwedd mis Mawrth. Byddwn ni wedyn wedi dechrau paratoi'r ail gylch o ymchwiliadau safonau, ac mae rhyw 130 o sefydliadau yn y cylch hwnnw. Byddwn yn cyflwyno i Lywodraeth Cymru ganlyniad y broses ymchwiliadau safonau ddiwedd mis Mai y flwyddyn nesaf, ac rydym eto wedi clywed y Prif Weinidog yn dweud y bore yma fod bwriad i gael y rheoliadau hynny mewn lle erbyn diwedd 2015. Rydym wedi cynllunio trydydd cylch o ymchwiliadau safonau a fydd yn cynnwys rhyw 230 o sefydliadau, rhai ohonynt gyda chynlluniau iaith a rhai heb gynlluniau iaith. Y bwriad oedd y byddem yn dechrau'r ymchwiliadau safonau cylch 3 yn ystod 2015. Nid ydym wedi cael cadarnhad o amseru'r Llywodraeth ar y trydydd cylch hwnnw.

Ms Huws: We now know exactly what the dates for the first round will be—the first 26. We know that those regulations will be brought forward, and the hope is that they will have gone through all of the statutory processes by the end of March. We will then have started to make preparations for the second round of standards investigations, and there are some 130 organisations and bodies included in that round. We will be presenting to the Welsh Government the outcome of those standards investigations at the end of May of next year, and, again, we have heard the First Minister say this morning that the intention is to get those regulations in place by the end of 2015. We have planned a third round of standards investigations, which will include some 230 organisations, some of which have language schemes and some of which do not. The intention was that we would start those standards investigations for the third round during 2015. We have not received confirmation of the Government's timetable for that third round.

[213] **Mark Isherwood:** So, are you still concerned or are you now reassured by the comments that he made?

[214] **Ms Huws:** Yn sicr ynglŷn â chylchoedd 1 a 2.

Ms Huws: We have an assurance on rounds 1 and 2.

[215] Rydym yn gwybod yn gywir y dyddiadau. Mae sefydliadau cylch 3, yn

We know exactly what the dates are. The organisations in round 3 will naturally, at

naturiol, ar ryw bwynt, yn mynd i ofyn pryd y byddant o dan y rheoliadau oherwydd eu bod wedi cael eu henwi. Felly, maent yn gwybod eu bod yng nghylch 3. Rydym yn hapus â'r amserlen ar gyfer cylchoedd 1 a 2. Bydd angen eglurder ar yr amserlen ar gyfer cylch 3.

some point, be enquiring when they will be included in the regulations because they have been named. So, they know that they are in round 3. We are happy with the timetable for rounds 1 and 2. There will be a need for clarity on the timetable for round 3.

[216] **Christine Chapman:** Jocelyn, did you have any questions?

[217] **Jocelyn Davies:** I just wondered whether you would tell us a little bit about the statutory inquiry that you did into health. I know that you mentioned health earlier, I think, in response to Gwenda. Did you undertake that because of casework that you had had? Obviously, you came up with a range of recommendations, which are very newly published—I think that they were only published in the summer. Perhaps you would also like to tell us about the Welsh Government response to that, and when you think that patients might see a difference.

[218] **Ms Huws:** Roedd y gwaith a wnaethom ar yr ymchwiliad gofal sylfaenol yn ddarn o waith sylweddol; rwyf wedi dweud hynny sawl gwaith heddiw. Rydym yn falch iawn o ansawdd y gwaith a wnaethom. Rydym yn falch iawn hefyd o ansawdd yr ymwneud. Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros iechyd, fel ag yr oedd hi ar y pryd, am roi tystiolaeth. Cyflwynodd y Gweinidog dros iechyd a'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros iechyd dystiolaeth, fel ag y gwnaeth y prif swyddog meddygol ac ystod eang o bobl. Ar ben hynny, gwnaethom waith ymchwil gyda 1,000 o ddefnyddwyr o'r gwasanaeth. Felly, roedd yn ddarn sylweddol o waith. Cyflwynasom yr adroddiad ym mis Mehefin. Roedd 33 o argymhellion yn ymwneud â gwahanol feysydd; rhai yn ymwneud â chynllunio gwasanaethau, rhai yn ymwneud â'r cynnig rhagweithiol, rhai yn ymwneud â hyfforddiant a pharatoi'r gweithlu, a rhai yn ymwneud â thechnoleg gwybodaeth o fewn y gwasanaethau iechyd. Er enghraifft, mae un argymhelliad yn cyfeirio at y ffaith nad ydyw'n cofnodi yn ganolog dewis iaith y claf. Byddech yn disgwyl, er enghraifft, gyda systemau technoleg gwybodaeth heddiw mai unwaith y byddai'n rhaid i chi gofnodi hynny ac y byddai hynny'n gwneud bywyd yn haws i bawb. Felly, roedd pethau bach a phethau mawr.

Ms Huws: The work that we did on the primary care inquiry was a significant piece of work; I have said that several times today. We are very proud of the quality of the work that we undertook. We are also very proud of the quality of the engagement. I thank the Deputy Minister for health, as she was at the time, for providing evidence. The Minister for health and the Deputy Minister for health provided evidence, as did the chief medical officer and a broad range of people. Furthermore, we carried out research with 1,000 service users. So, it was a significant piece of work. We presented that report in June. There were 33 recommendations relating to different areas; some relating to service planning, some relating to the proactive offer, some relating to training and workforce preparation, and some relating to information technology within the health services. For example, one recommendation refers to the fact that they do not centrally record the language choice of the patient. You would expect, for instance, with modern IT systems that you would only need to record that once, which would make life easier for everyone. So, there were minor things but also major things.

[219] O ran yr ymateb, gwnaethom gyhoeddi ym mis Mehefin ein bod eisoes wedi derbyn ymateb oddi wrth amryw o fyrddau iechyd sydd yn dweud eu bod eisoes

In terms of the response, we announced in June that we had already received a response from a number of health boards that said that they are already starting to make progress on

yn dechrau symud ar yr argymhellion. Mae'r prif swyddog meddygol, Ruth Hussey, yn ei hadroddiad blynyddol wedi cyfeirio hefyd at y ffaith ei bod yn cydnabod hwn fel darn sylweddol o waith.

the recommendations. The chief medical officer, Ruth Hussey, in her annual report has also referred to the fact that she recognises this as a significant piece of work.

[220] Yn ein hargymhellion, gofynasom i Lywodraeth Cymru i ymateb o fewn chwe mis i gyhoeddi'r argymhellion. Cawsom gadarnhad oddi wrth y Gweinidog ei fod yn bwriadu gwneud hynny yn llawn. Felly, byddwn yn disgwyl, erbyn dechrau Rhagfyr, yr ateb llawn hwnnw oddi wrth y Llywodraeth. Un peth y gwnaf gyfeirio ato yw fod y broses yn un nid yn unig o gasglu tystiolaeth, a oedd yn gadarnhaol, ond roeddech hefyd yn gweld newid agwedd yn digwydd yn y broses o gyflwyno tystiolaeth. Credaf ein bod wedi gweld hynny ar ran cyrff a oedd wedi bod yn reit fileinig i'r syniad. Serch hynny, wrth fynd drwy'r broses o gynnig tystiolaeth, roeddynt yn gweld nad oedd yn gymaint o her iddynt, a'i fod yn cynnig cyfle iddynt. Nid enwaf y sefydliadau hyn, ond mae sefydliadau yn cynrychioli'r proffesiwn sydd wedi newid agwedd yn y broses o gynnig tystiolaeth ac o drafod.

In our recommendations, we asked the Welsh Government to respond within six months of the recommendations' publication. We received confirmation from the Minister that he intended to do so fully. Therefore, we will expect, by the beginning of December, to receive that full response from the Government. One thing that I will refer to here is that the process was not only one of gathering evidence, which was positive, but that you also saw a change of attitude during the process of presenting evidence. I think that we saw that from organisations that had been quite hostile to the idea. However, during the process of presenting evidence, they saw that it was not such a huge challenge for them and that it actually presented them with an opportunity. I will not name these organisations, but there are organisations representing the profession that have changed their attitude during the process of presenting evidence and discussions.

[221] **Jocelyn Davies:** In relation to the budget and your budget cut, as you mentioned, obviously these are statutory inquiries, but you do not have to do them. You can choose to do them if you feel that it is necessary. Do you think that, in the future, because of budget restrictions, you might find yourself not being able to carry out inquiries of this nature that you would like to have undertaken?

[222] **Ms Huws:** Dewis gwneud yr ymholiad hwn a wnaethom ni, ond dewis gwneud hynny ar sail y dystiolaeth a gawsom gan bobl bod hwn yn fater mor bwysig iddynt. Byddai wedi bod yn fai arnaf, a byddai wedi bod yn drosedd pe na fyddem wedi gwneud y darn hwn o waith. Mae yna feysydd eraill. Gallem ragweld meysydd o ran sgiliau lle gallai darn o waith tebyg ateb rhai o'r cwestiynau sydd wedi'u codi ynglŷn â gwau meysydd polisi at ei gilydd. Byddwn i'n ei ffeindio yn anodd—nid o ran egwyddor, nac o ran awydd, ond o ran y gyllideb i allu cyflawni'r math sylweddol a phwysig hwnnw o waith. Mae cael lot o adolygiadau bach yn grêt, ond mae cael un darn o waith sylweddol yn gallu symud sector yn ei gyfanrwydd.

Ms Huws: We chose to undertake this inquiry, but we did so on the basis of the evidence that we received from people that this was an important issue for them. I would have been at fault, and it would have been a crime if we had not carried out this piece of work. There are other areas. We could anticipate issues related to skills where a similar piece of work could resolve some of the issues that have been raised in terms of drawing policy areas together. I would find it difficult—not in principle or in terms of desire, but from the point of view of the budget to carry out that significant and important work. Having many minor reviews is all well and good, but having one major piece of work can shift a sector as a whole.

[223] **Christine Chapman:** Is that okay?

[224] **Jocelyn Davies:** Yes, fine. Thank you.

[225] **Christine Chapman:** Gwenda, did you want to come in with any questions?

[226] **Gwenda Thomas:** Mae tri rhan i'm cwestiwn. Y cyntaf yw: allwch chi ehangu ar sut yr ydych yn disgwyl i gyrff cyhoeddus wella'r modd maen nhw'n cydymffurfio â'u cynlluniau iaith, yn enwedig mewn cyfnod o gynni ariannol fel hwn? Yn ail, allwch chi roi mwy o fanylion am y gwaith a wnaethoch i fonitro'r defnydd o rwydweithiau cymdeithasol gan gyrff cyhoeddus a'r prif bethau i'w nodi o'r gwaith hwn? Yn olaf, allwch chi ehangu ar y rhesymau dros anfon un o'ch swyddogion ar secondiad i Swyddfa Cymru a pha ganlyniadau rydych yn gobeithio eu gweld yn deillio o hyn?

Gwenda Thomas: There are three parts to my question. The first is: can you expand on how you expect public bodies to improve the way in which they comply with their Welsh language schemes, particularly in a time of significant budget constraints like this? Secondly, can you give more details about the work you did to monitor the use of social networks by public bodies and the main points to note from this work? Finally, can you expand on the reasons for seconding one of your officers to the Wales Office and what outcomes do you hope to see from that?

[227] **Ms Huws:** Fe wnawn ni ddechrau gyda'r cynlluniau iaith. Mae'n adeg anodd ar sefydliadau sy'n gweithredu cynlluniau iaith—nid oes cwestiwn am hynny—ond beth yr ydym wedi'i weld yw bod cynlluniau iaith yn arwain at welliant o ran gwasanaethau. Mae'r ymwybyddiaeth o'r pwysigrwydd i wella yn y lle cyntaf yn arwain at welliant o ran gwasanaethau.

Ms Huws: We will start with the language schemes. It is a difficult time for organisations which are implementing language schemes—there is no doubt about that—but what we have seen is that language schemes lead to improvements in services. The awareness of the importance of improvement in the first place leads to an improvement in services.

[228] Yn ystod y gwaith monitro rydym yn ei wneud, rydym yn gallu bwydo yn ôl i'r sectorau y prif feysydd y mae angen arnynt wella a chamu ymlaen. O wneud hynny fesul sector, mae modd wedyn i gyrff weithio gyda'i gilydd. Rydym wedi gweld hynny yn y sector iechyd yn benodol, lle mae swyddogion iaith y byrddau iechyd wedi dod at ei gilydd. Yr un her sydd iddynt i gyd, ac maent yn rhannu arfer da a phrofiadau. Rydym yn gweld yr un math o beth yn digwydd o ran awdurdodau lleol hefyd, lle maent yn gweithio ar y cyd i ymateb i her. Felly, mae hynny'n bwysig.

During the monitoring work that we carry out, we can provide feedback to the sectors on the main areas for improvement and progression. In doing that on a sectoral basis, organisations can then collaborate. We have seen that in the health sector specifically, where the language officers of health boards have come together. They all face the same challenges, and they share good practice and experiences. We also see the same kind of thing happening in local authorities, where they are working collaboratively to respond to a challenge. Therefore, that is important.

[229] Mae'n adeg anodd, ond mae'r broses o osod targedau penodol—. Un o'r pethau rydym wedi ei osod fel targed i'r gwahanol sectorau yw gwneud awdit sgiliau i ddeall beth sydd ganddynt yn eu sefydliadau yn barod. Mae pob awdit sgiliau yn reit debyg, felly unwaith mae un model wedi cael ei greu, mae modd i bawb arall ddefnyddio'r un model. Felly, mae esiamplau lle mae modd inni symud y rheini mewn un sector ymlaen

It is a difficult time, but the process of setting specific targets—. One of the things that we have set as a target for the various sectors is to carry out a skills audit to understand what they already have within their organisations. All skills audits are very similar, so once you have a model, everyone else can use that same model. Therefore, there are examples where we can move those in one sector forward together, with the co-operation of

gyda'i gilydd, gyda chydweithrediad cyrff fel y WLGA a Chonffederasiwn GIG Cymru. Felly, nid problem unigol ydyw wastad; mae'n gallu bod yn broblem o ran sector, ac felly gellid ymateb fel sector. Rydym yn ymateb fesul sector.

organisations such as the WLGA and the Welsh NHS Confederation. Therefore, it is not always an individual problem; it can be a sectoral problem, and therefore they can respond as a sector. We do respond sector by sector.

[230] O ran y gwaith a wnaethom o ran edrych ar rwydweithiau cymdeithasol, gwnaethom hynny oherwydd ein bod yn sylweddoli bod lot o gyrff cyhoeddus yn anfon negeseuon allan nawr drwy drydaru. Mae'n faes rwy'n ffeindio'n od iawn, oherwydd fy oedran, ond mae'n ffordd o gyfathrebu â'r cyhoedd a hynny yn glou iawn. Beth roeddem yn ei weld oedd nad oeddynt o reidrwydd yn sylweddoli bod angen iddyn nhw anfon neges allan yn y ddwy iaith. Felly, roedd angen inni gasglu'r wybodaeth honno at ei gilydd. Darn bach o waith ydoedd, ond yr hyn a oedd yn dod trwyddo oedd bod dros 40% o awdurdodau lleol ddim yn anfon negeseuon allan yn y ddwy iaith, er, efallai, bod ganddynt gynllun iaith a oedd yn dweud, 'Byddwn yn cyfathrebu â'r cyhoedd yn ddwyieithog'. Felly, dyna ddarn o waith a oedd yn tynnu eu sylw at hynny, gan roi'r neges iddynt, a rhoi ambell i hwb iddynt newid eu gweithgaredd. Wyt ti eisiau ategu rhywbeth at hynny, Dyfan?

In terms of the work that we carried out on social networks, we did that work because we realised that many public bodies were now sending messages out on Twitter. It is an area that I personally find very strange, given my age, but it is a way of communicating with the public very swiftly. What we found was that they did not necessarily realise that they needed to send out a message in both languages. Therefore, we needed to gather that data. It was a small piece of work, but what came through was that over 40% of local authorities did not send out messages in both languages, although they might have had a language scheme that said, 'We will communicate with the public bilingually'. Therefore, that piece of work drew their attention to that, and sent them a message and actually gave them a nudge to change the way that they worked. Do you have anything to add to that, Dyfan?

[231] **Mr Sion:** O ran y maes hwnnw'n benodol, roedd lot o awdurdodau lleol yn dueddol o ystyried y pwnc fel mater technoleg gwybodaeth yn hytrach na mater o gyfathrebu yn benodol. Felly, mae'r adroddiad yn mynd i'r afael â hynny.

Mr Sion: On that particular area of work, many local authorities tended to consider it as an IT issue rather than as a communication issue specifically. So, the report addresses that.

[232] Gofynnoch gwestiwn hefyd ynglŷn â'r secondiad i Swyddfa Cymru. Mae hwnnw'n gam pragmataidd er mwyn ceisio datblygu'r gwasanaethau y mae cyrff San Steffan a chyrff y Goron yn eu datblygu. Mae dwy ran i'r broses. Y cam cyntaf oedd mapio'r gwasanaethau mae cyrff y Goron yn eu darparu yn Gymraeg ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r rhan honno o'r prosiect wedi dod i ben rŵan. Mae'r ail ran yn edrych yn fwy i'r dyfodol ac yn ystyried i ba raddau y bydd cyrff y Goron yn gallu delio â safonau maes o law, ac mae hefyd yn edrych ar y graddau maen nhw'n ystyried y Gymraeg wrth ddatblygu polisïau. Er eu bod nhw'n bolisïau San Steffan, maen nhw'n dal yn aml yn cael *impact* yng

You also asked the question about the secondment to the Wales Office. That is a pragmatic step to try to develop the services that Westminster bodies and Crown bodies are developing. There are two parts to the process. The first step was to map the services that Crown bodies provide through the medium of Welsh at present. That part of the project is now complete. The second part is looking more to the future and considering to what extent Crown bodies will be able to deal with standards in due course, and also to what extent they consider the Welsh language in policy development. Although they are Westminster policies, they often have an impact in Wales too. So, that is a pragmatic

Nghymru hefyd. Felly, mae hwnnw'n gam pragmataidd i geisio gwella pethau.

step to try to improve matters.

[233] **Ms Huws:** Rwy'n credu ein bod wedi sylweddoli bod cymaint o'n gwasanaethau ni yng Nghymru, gwasanaethau sydd yn eithriadol o bwysig i ddinasyddion, yn dal i ddeillio o San Steffan. Os edrychwch chi ar fudd-daliadau, maen nhw i gyd yn deillio o San Steffan, a gwelsom gyda datblygiadau fel yr *universal credit* ei fod yn bwysig cadw golwg ar y Gymraeg neu byddai'r gwasanaethau Cymraeg yn diflannu. Yn yr un modd, mae gwasanaethau cyfiawnder yn deillio yn bennaf o Lundain, o San Steffan, ac mae'n bwysig iawn i gadw llygad arnyn nhw ac i'w hatgoffa nhw o'u cyfrifoldebau nhw i Gymru yng Nghymru o ran darparu gwasanaethau.

Ms Huws: I think that we have realised that so many of our services in Wales, services that are exceptionally important to citizens, still emanate from Westminster. If you look at benefits, they all emanate from Westminster, and we saw with developments such as universal credit that it is important to keep that overview on the Welsh language, or the Welsh-language services would disappear. Likewise, justice services mainly emanate from London, from Westminster, and it is very important just to keep an overview of them and to remind them of their responsibilities in terms of service provision in Wales.

[234] **Christine Chapman:** Thank you. We have nine or 10 minutes left. I call Janet.

[235] **Janet Finch-Saunders:** What are your views on the implications of the successful judicial review that you brought against National Savings and Investments?

[236] **Ms Huws:** Yn gyntaf, a gaf i ddweud ein bod ni'n falch ei fod wedi bod yn llwyddiannus? Nid oedd y penderfyniad am adolygiad barnwrol yn un hawdd i'w wneud, ond, yn y bôn, fel comisiynydd, nid oeddwn yn teimlo bod gennym ddewis. Pe baem ni wedi gadael i Gynilion Cenedlaethol gamu i ffwrdd o'i gyfrifoldebau cynllun iaith, byddai hynny wedi rhoi caniatâd, fwy neu lai, i sefydliadau eraill yn Llundain a sefydliadau'r Goron yn Llundain i wneud yr un peth. Felly, roedd hi'n benderfyniad anodd ond, rwy'n credu, yn benderfyniad cywir i'w herio ac i ddweud bod ganddo gyfrifoldebau o ran ei gwasanaethau i Gymru o hyd. Mae hynny'n mynd nôl at y cwestiwn o ran gwasanaethau rydym ni'n eu cael a pharhau i'w cael o Lundain. Yn fwy na hynny, mae wedi rhoi neges glir i San Steffan o'i gyfrifoldebau o dan Ddeddf 1993 a Mesur y Gymraeg (Cymru) 2011.

Ms Huws: First of all, may I say that we are pleased that it was successful? The decision about the judicial review was not an easy one to make, but, as a commissioner, I fundamentally did not believe that we had any other option. Had we allowed National Savings and Investments to step back from its language scheme responsibilities, it would have permitted, more or less, other institutions in London and Crown bodies in London to do the same thing. So, it was a difficult decision, but, I believe, the right decision to challenge it and to say that it still had responsibilities from the point of view of its services in Wales. That takes us back to the question of the services that we receive and continue to receive from London. More than that, it has sent a clear message to Westminster about its responsibilities under the 1993 Act and the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011.

[237] Y peth arall mae wedi ei wneud yw creu ymwybyddiaeth ymysg y farnwriaeth yng Nghymru a Lloegr fod angen cael barnwyr sy'n gallu gweithio yn y ddwy iaith. Yr adolygiad barnwrol hwnnw, ac mae'n syndod i mi, oedd y cyntaf a gafodd ei glywed erioed yn y Gymraeg yng Nghymru. Cefais fy synnu oherwydd byddwn wedi

The other thing that it has done is to create awareness among the judiciary in England and Wales that there is a need for judges who can work through the medium of both languages. That judicial review, and this is a surprise to me, was the very first to be heard through the medium of Welsh in Wales. That was surprising as I would have expected that

disgwyl y byddai adolygiadau barnwrol eraill wedi cael eu cynnal drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ond dyna'r un cyntaf. Mae hynny wedi arwain yn uniongyrchol i'r Arglwydd Brif Ustus John Thomas, gyhoeddi bythefnos yn ôl ei fod yn mynd i gynnal adolygiad llawn o sgiliau ieithyddol y farnwriaeth yng Nghymru er mwyn sicrhau y bydd yn gallu cyflawni ei gyfrifoldebau o ran cael barnwr a fydd yn gallu cynnal adolygiadau barnwrol yn y Gymraeg. Gwnaeth y barnwr gynnal yr adolygiad barnwrol hwnnw drwy wrando ar gyfieithu. Dyna sut roedd yn clywed yr achos, ond dywedodd yr Arglwydd Brif Ustus wythnos ddiwethaf y byddai hynny'n hollol annerbyniol lle'r oedd plentyn yn rhoi tystiolaeth mewn achos llys, ac felly, roedd yn mynd i sicrhau bod barnwyr Cymru yn y dyfodol yn gallu cyflawni eu dyletswyddau ieithyddol o ran y Gymraeg. Felly, mae wedi cael *impact* ar y farnwriaeth hefyd a chyfiawnder yng Nghymru. Roedd yn brofiad da i ni fel sefydliad i baratoi'r fath achos a llwyddo.

other judicial reviews would have been heard through the medium of Welsh, but that was the first. That led directly to Lord Chief Justice John Thomas announcing a fortnight ago that he will conduct a full review into the language skills of the judiciary in Wales to ensure that he can undertake his responsibilities in having a judge who can hold judicial reviews through the medium of Welsh. The judge carried out the judicial review by listening to interpretation. That is how he heard the case, but the Lord Chief Justice last week said that that would be totally unacceptable where a child was giving evidence in a court case, and that he would therefore ensure that judges in Wales in the future could meet their responsibilities from the point of view of the Welsh language. So, it has had an impact on the judiciary as well, and on justice in Wales. It was a good experience for us as an organisation to prepare that kind of case and succeed.

[238] **Janet Finch-Saunders:** What are your views on the implications of your recent ruling regarding the interference in the use of Welsh at Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board, my own health board?

[239] **Ms Huws:** Rydych wedi cyfeirio at yr ail dro pan wnaethom ni ddefnyddio Mesur y Gymraeg (Cymru) 2011. Cyn y Mesur hwn, nid oedd comisiynydd na swyddogaeth i edrych ar y math hwn o achos. Mae'n achos sydd yn codi o adran 111 Mesur y Gymraeg (Cymru) 2011 lle gall person gwyno wrth y comisiynydd os ydynt yn teimlo bod eu rhyddid i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg yn cael ei rwystro mewn unrhyw ffordd, hynny yw, bod ymyrraeth. Cododd achos gyda bwrdd iechyd Betsi Cadwaladr lle'r oedd mam a'i phlentyn yn cyfathrebu yn y Gymraeg, ac roedd honiad ar y pryd bod y meddyg wedi eu rhwystro. Aethom drwy broses ymchwiliad. Profwyd bod ymyrraeth ac nad oedd cyfiawnhad clinigol dros yr ymyrraeth honno. Rwy'n falch o ddweud bod y bwrdd iechyd wedi derbyn ein dyfarniad bod ymyrraeth wedi digwydd, nad oedd hynny yn dderbyniol ac nad oes rhesymau clinigol dros hynny. Mae'r bwrdd iechyd nawr wedi datgan ei fod yn mynd i newid ei bolisïau a'i hyfforddiant. Fodd bynnag, nid dim ond neges i fwrdd iechyd Betsi Cadwaladr sydd yn y fan hon, ond neges i

Ms Huws: You have referred to the second time that we have used the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011. Before this Measure, there was no commissioner or function to look at this kind of case. It was a case arising from section 111 of the Welsh Language Measure (Wales) 2011 where a person can complain to the commissioner if they believe that their freedom to use the Welsh language is being restricted in any way, that is, that there is interference. A case arose with Betsi Cadwaladr health board where a mother and child were communicating in Welsh, and an allegation was made at the time that a doctor had stopped them doing that. We went through an inquiry process. It was proven that there was interference and that there was no clinical justification for that interference. I am pleased to say that the health board accepted our ruling that interference had taken place, that that was not acceptable and that there were no clinical reasons for that. The health board has now declared that it is going to amend its policies and training. However, this is not just a message for Betsi Cadwaladr health board, but also a message

fyrddau iechyd Cymru bod yn rhaid iddynt feddwl am sefyllfaoedd lle bydd pobl yn dewis neu angen cyfathrebu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, a bod ganddyn nhw'r hawl i wneud hynny.

for health boards throughout Wales that they must consider situations where people will choose or need to communicate through the medium of Welsh, and that they have the right to do so.

[240] **Janet Finch-Saunders:** Of course. Could you expand on the reasons for commissioning a review of your complaints process and what better outcomes you expect this to lead to?

[241] **Ms Huws:** Ar ôl dwy flynedd o weithredu, roeddem ni'n sylweddoli fwyfwy bwysigrwydd cwynion. Rydym newydd sôn am achos a wnaeth ddeillio o gŵyn a fydd yn newid arfer ar draws Cymru o ran byrddau iechyd. Felly, sylweddolom ni fod angen, ar sail yr adolygiad, adeiladu tîm arbenigol a fydd yn delio â chwynion yn y dyfodol. Yn ystod y ddwy flynedd gyntaf, roedd y cyfrifoldeb yn cael ei rannu ar draws y sefydliad. Bydd tîm arbenigol nawr yn gweithio i'r safonau uchaf sydd yn cael eu gosod gan ombwdsmyn. Bydd y tîm yn gweithio o fewn cyfundrefn debyg i'r safonau sydd yn ddisgwyliedig o ombwdsmyn, yn tynnu ar arfer da. Bydd hefyd yn gallu creu pwynt cyswllt amlwg i ddinasyddion Cymru a siaradwyr y Gymraeg, fel eu bod yn gwybod eu bod yn gallu troi at y tîm hwn pan fydd ganddynt gŵyn neu gons'yrn ynglŷn â defnydd o'r Gymraeg. Felly, bydd yn creu tîm a fydd yn rhoi hyder i gwynwyr bod arbenigwyr yn edrych ar eu hachos.

Ms Huws: After two years' activity, we increasingly realised the importance of complaints. We have just talked about a case that arose from a complaint that will cause a change of practice in health boards throughout Wales. So, we realised, on the basis of the review, that we needed to build a specialist team that will deal with complaints in the future. During the first two years, the responsibility was shared across the organisation. There will now be a specialist team that will work to the highest standards set by ombudsmen. The team will work within a similar system to the standards that are expected of ombudsmen, drawing on good practice. It can also create a clear point of contact for the citizens of Wales and for Welsh speakers, so that they know that they can turn to this team when they have a complaint or concern about the use of the Welsh language. So, it will create a team that will give complainants confidence that specialists are reviewing their case.

[242] **Christine Chapman:** Thank you. There are no more questions, so I thank both of you for coming today and answering Members' questions. We will send you a transcript of the meeting to check for factual accuracy. Thank you very much.

12:08

Papurau i'w Nodi
Papers to Note

[243] **Christine Chapman:** Before we close the public part of the meeting, there are a number of papers to note.

Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o'r Cyfarfod ac o'r Cyfarfod ar 5 Tachwedd 2014
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Meeting and from the Meeting on 5 November 2014

[244] **Christine Chapman:** I move that

the committee resolves to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting and from the

meeting on 5 November in accordance with Standing Order 17.42(vi).

[245] Do Members agree? I see that you do.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.

Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 12:08.
The public part of the meeting ended at 12:08.